

A photograph of a cornfield with a silo in the background under a cloudy sky. The corn is in the foreground, and the silo is visible in the distance. The sky is blue with white clouds.

Modernism in Bartholomew County,
Indiana
1942 – 1999
National Historic
Landmark Theme Study

prepared by:

Laura Thayer, Architectural Historian

Meg Storrow, Landscape Architect

John Kinsella, Urban Designer/Planner

Louis Joyner, Architect

Malcolm Cairns, Landscape Architect

**United States Department of the Interior
National Park Service**

**National Register of Historic Places
Multiple Property Documentation Form**

This form is for use in documenting multiple property groups relating to one or several historic contexts. See instructions in *How to Complete the Multiple Property Documentation Form* (National Register Bulletin 16B). Complete each item by entering the requested information. For additional space, use continuation sheets (Form 10-900-a). Use a typewriter, word processor, or computer to complete all items.

New Submission Amended Submission

A. Name of Multiple Property Listing

**MODERNISM IN ARCHITECTURE, LANDSCAPE ARCHITECTURE, DESIGN AND ART IN
BARTHOLOMEW COUNTY, INDIANA, 1942-1999, NATIONAL HISTORIC LANDMARK THEME STUDY**

B. Associated Historic Contexts

Patronage in Public Architecture in Bartholomew County, 1957-1965
Modern Architecture and Landscape Architecture in Bartholomew County, 1942-1965

C. Form Prepared by

name/title Laura Thayer, Architectural Historian; Margaret Storrow, Landscape Architect; John Kinsella, Urban Planner/Designer; Louis Joyner, Architect; and Malcolm Cairns, Landscape Architect

organization Storrow Kinsella Partnership Inc. date 17 September 1999

street and number 212 West Tenth Street, Studio A440 telephone 317-639-3420

city or town Indianapolis state Indiana zip code 46202

D. Certification

As the designated authority under the National Historic Preservation Act of 1966, as amended, I hereby certify that this documentation form meets the National Register documentation standards and sets forth requirements for the listing of related properties consistent with the National Register criteria. This submission meets the procedural and professional requirements set forth in 36 CFR Part 60 and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards and Guidelines for Archaeology and Historic Preservation. (See continuation sheet for additional comments.)

Signature and title of certifying official

Date

State or Federal agency and bureau

I hereby certify that this multiple property documentation form has been approved by the National Register as a basis for evaluating related properties for listing in the National Register.

Signature of the Keeper

Date

E. STATEMENT OF HISTORIC CONTEXTS

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Two themes have been identified in the development of Columbus and Bartholomew County as a center of Modern architecture:

- **Patronage in Public Architecture**
A local business foundation established a program to pay the design fees for local, public projects if the client group selected the design firm from a list developed by an independent panel of experts. The patronage program started over forty years ago, and since then many public resources have been constructed. In addition, the patronage program fostered an outstanding design sensibility in the community, resulting in private sector construction of additional Modern architecture resources.
- **Modern Architecture and Landscape Architecture**
The Columbus area hosts an exceptional collection of Modern buildings, landscapes, and public sculpture that reflects the development of these design idioms on a national basis. Many of the designers experimented with concepts and design forms in Columbus that they then applied to larger and more famous works elsewhere. These cultural resources reflect the design trends of the period in which they were constructed in response to a quest for excellence in design and creative problem solving. There is a broad cross-section of designers represented, rather than a collection of works by a small group.

The program was founded on the vision of J. Irwin Miller, who guided the Cummins Engine Foundation into being the catalyst in the development of Columbus and the surrounding area as a nationally recognized center of outstanding Modern architecture. He recognized, long before the term became fashionable, that a livable city benefits its business and industry by attracting and sustaining a high quality workforce.

OVERVIEW OF COLUMBUS

Columbus is the seat of Bartholomew County in south central Indiana. In 1990, the city had a population of 33,948. It is located on the East Fork of the White River, near the intersection of Interstate 65 and State Road 46. The city is serviced by a Conrail line, formerly part of the Pennsylvania Railroad system. Columbus is the only city in Bartholomew County. Towns include Hope, in the northwestern part of the county, and Taylorsville, in the northern part.

Columbus can be described as an island within a glacial outwash. The town developed at the convergence of several rivers that offered power, water, convenient waste disposal, and pre-railroad shipment to and from the Ohio River. The transportation-based historic development of the town carried into the railroad age and has continued to adapt to the Interstate era. A visitor approaching by the Interstate from either Louisville or Indianapolis passes through a unique interstate interchange and bridge, through an agricultural floodplain, over another unique bridge over the East Fork of the White River, and directly into a compact downtown.

There is an excellent core of Modern and historic buildings that form the downtown, creating scale and unique character. The presence of the governmental and institutional buildings gives the downtown civic and cultural importance as the heart of the city. Many of the architectural resources are focused there.

Improvements to transportation and open space infrastructure have resulted in remarkable connectivity and utilization of the natural floodplain system as accessible open space. Columbus sought multi-disciplinary design leadership from the architecture, engineering and landscape architecture professions to assist in developing a downtown streetscape, transportation improvements to create a Front Door to the community, and the renovation of a large urban park. This work adds substance to Columbus being on the forefront in utilizing the best design skills and latest technology in solving current problems, whether it is for a discrete building or for public infrastructure systems.

PATRONAGE IN PUBLIC ARCHITECTURE IN BARTHOLOMEW COUNTY, 1957-1965

The patronage of the Cummins Engine Foundation has been the catalyst in the development of Columbus and the surrounding area as a nationally recognized center of outstanding Modern architecture. The resources evaluated under this historic context were constructed between 1957 and 1965. Buildings and structures continued to be supported by the foundation after 1965. The most recent of these was the Second Street Bridge completed in 1999. Because the program continues to the present, information is presented in this context on the program in its entirety; however, only the earliest stage of the program is being evaluated for its historical importance and only a select few properties are being nominated for their national significance.

The Patronage in Public Architecture theme is concerned with the impacts of a patronage program on a community. In the case of Columbus, the patron established guidelines for works accomplished within the program, and then gave design control to the community, resulting in independent participation outside the boundaries of the program. The Columbus program is an informal program that operates on recommended guidelines. Cummins Engine Foundation initiated the program in the late 1950s by offering to pay architects' fees for school buildings on the condition that the school board select the architect for each project from a list developed by an independent panel. Ultimately the program expanded to include all types of public buildings, as well as parks, public art and city planning studies.

The impacts of the Cummins Engine Foundation program may be summarized as follows:

- National recognition of the Columbus area as a center of Modern architecture
- Improved quality of the built environment
- Establishment of community identity
- Fostering construction of Modern architecture in the private sector

The first period of development related to the Patronage Context extended from 1957 to 1965, a period of population growth during which several new schools and other public buildings were needed. Six of the 14 educational buildings and eight of the total number of buildings supported by patronage between 1957 and 1999 were built during this time. After Richards Elementary School (1965) was completed, Cummins Engine Foundation's program was expanded to include public buildings of all types, not just schools.

Background

Bartholomew County was organized in 1821 and Columbus was established on the East Fork of the White River in 1821. The town operated initially as a regional agricultural market. Its position on railroads linking major markets contributed to industrial development starting in the mid-nineteenth century. Among important employers of the late nineteenth century were American Starch Works, started in 1880, and Reeves Pulley Company, formed in 1888. The city was adversely affected by the nationwide depression of the early 1890s, and suffered a devastating blow when the starch works burned in 1895 and was not rebuilt. Population growth slowed as the twentieth century approached, and in the decade between 1910 and 1920, the county's population decreased for the first time, from 24,813 to

23,887. During the same period, the population of Columbus increased by only two percent, to 8,990 in 1920. These local trends reflected a period of transition in Indiana, between 1880-1920, when the population shifted from rural to urban.

At this point, Columbus might have remained a small county seat; however, two industries – Cummins Engine Company, established in 1919, and Noblitt-Sparks Industries (now Arvin Industries), which moved to Columbus in 1925 – promoted new growth. Government contracts during World War II, as well as high levels of demand for products in the post World War II era, led to rapid industrial development. By the end of the war, there were more than 90 industries in Columbus.¹ Between 1940 and 1950, the population grew from 11,738 to 18,370². A *Fortune* article of 1954 noted that the output of manufactured goods in Columbus had increased from \$17 million in 1940 to \$200 million, and that the labor force had grown from 3,700 to 12,000.³

By the late 1940s, the city was suffering many side effects of prosperity. Infrastructure improvements were needed; there was a severe housing shortage; and schools were seriously overcrowded. The community recognized that solutions had to be produced soon. Local government made plans for a new water treatment facility and sewage disposal plant. An Indianapolis firm was hired to draft the city's first comprehensive plan in 1948. The first zoning and subdivision ordinances were passed in 1949.

The post-war era saw politicians forming partnerships with business leaders to address some of the problems. Mayor Robert Stevenson enlisted J. Irwin Miller, President of Cummins Engine Company, to chair a housing committee. Miller asked his friend, architect Eero Saarinen (1910-1961), to recommend an architect for an apartment project. Saarinen suggested Harry Weese (1915-1998). Stevenson and Miller interviewed the Chicago architect, who was subsequently hired to design Columbus Village (1951).

The time taken to seek out a talented young designer for the Columbus Village project reflected the concern of Miller and others about the many new buildings that would be constructed in Columbus over the next few years. They felt that poorly designed buildings would have a negative impact on the city, whereas attractive, well-designed buildings could establish high standards for the built environment.

Columbus Village was not the community's first experience with Modern architecture. In the late 1930s, the congregation of the Tabernacle Christian Church had identified a need for a new building. The building committee, which included members of Miller's family, hired internationally esteemed architect Eliel Saarinen (1873-1950) of Bloomfield Hills, Michigan. The resulting edifice, First Christian Church (1942), is now recognized as one of the outstanding Modern churches in America.

Cummins Engine Foundation Support of Schools

Cummins Engine Company was founded in 1919, but did not make a profit until the late 1930s. During World War II and in the years following, the company grew rapidly, and was in a position to fund projects that would benefit the community in which it operated. Company contributions included \$45,000 for the construction of a parkway along Haw Creek and \$74,126 for various other city improvements.⁴ In 1954, Cummins Engine Foundation was established as a means to manage the

¹ Columbus Plan Commission, *1985 Comprehensive Plan for the City of Columbus*, (Columbus: Columbus Plan Commission, 1967).

² U.S. Census of Population, 1940, 1950.

³ "Businessmen Rebuild an Indiana Town," *Fortune*, July 1954.

⁴ Jeffrey L. Cruikshank and David B. Sicilia, *The Engine That Could* (Boston: Harvard Business School Press, 1997).

company's philanthropic activities. One of the foundation's first donations was \$100,000 for the proposed Jefferson School.

Just as critical as the need for more housing in Columbus in the post-World War II era was the need for schools. No educational buildings had been constructed in the city for years. In the early 1950s it was estimated that 10 new schools would be needed in the next 10 years to accommodate the growing school population. Cummins and other local businesses helped finance Jefferson, the first new school in Columbus since 1929. After the school was completed in 1954 there was dissatisfaction about its design among many members of the community, who viewed it as ordinary.

As planning began for a new north side elementary school, Miller recognized an opportunity and made a proposal to the school board: Cummins Engine Foundation would pay Harry Weese's fee if the board would hire him to design the building.⁵ By this time, Weese had worked on several projects for Cummins. The school board agreed, and Lillian C. Schmitt Elementary School was completed in 1957.

The school board soon came to an understanding with Cummins Engine Foundation. The foundation would pay the architect's fee for all new school buildings. The main condition imposed upon the board by the foundation was that it had to select the architect from a list compiled by an independent panel. The board agreed, and the program that would have a major impact on Columbus was launched. The first panel included Eero Saarinen, Douglas Haskell, editor of *Architectural Forum*, and Pietro Belluschi, dean of the architecture school at the Massachusetts Institute of Technology.⁶

In a 1981 interview with James Michener, Miller revealed how he had gotten the idea for the school program⁷. He had learned from Eero Saarinen of a State Department policy to hire leading American architects to design embassies. This inspired the program that would produce outstanding architectural design in Columbus. Instead of relying on established architectural talent, however, Miller wanted his program to favor promising young architects who were relatively unknown.

Miller has acknowledged that Cummins initiated the program largely for the good of the company. A more attractive community with good educational facilities stood a better chance of getting the leadership it needed in the fast-growing manufacturing culture of post World War II America. And if Columbus children were better educated because of well-designed schools, a higher quality work force might be the result. This pro-business attitude was echoed in the city's comprehensive plan, penned in 1965: "If the community is not attractive, it will be incapable of generating the kind of image it desires to prospective business and industry."

The Cummins Engine Foundation school program flourished, with 14 educational buildings constructed in a 32-year period. The program had originally covered only school buildings in Columbus, but was expanded to include the new Bartholomew County School Corporation boundaries when school consolidation was approved in 1965. Support was also extended to another school corporation within Bartholomew County for Hope Elementary School, completed in 1989. The school buildings constructed during the 1957-1989 period were:

Lillian C. Schmitt Elementary School (1957), 1057 27th Street
Architect: Harry Weese (1915-1998)

⁵ Jeffrey L. Cruikshank and David B. Sicilia, *The Engine That Could* (Boston: Harvard Business School Press, 1997) p.181.

⁶ Robert Campbell, "Modernism Meets Main Street," *Preservation* (Washington DC: National Trust for Historic Preservation, September/October 1998) p.40.

⁷ James A. Michener, *James A. Michener's U.S.A.* (New York: Crown Publishing, 1981).

Mabel McDowell Elementary School (1960), 2700 McKinley Avenue
(McDowell Adult Education Center)

Architect: John Carl Warnecke (1919-)

Northside Junior High School (1961), 2700 Maple Street
(Northside Middle School)

Architect: Harry Weese (1915-1998)

Parkside Elementary School (1962), 1400 Parkside Drive

Architect: Norman Fletcher (1917-), The Architects Collaborative

Bartholomew County School Corporation Administration Building (1963), 2650 Home Avenue

Architect: Norman Fletcher (1917-), The Architects Collaborative

W.D. Richards Elementary School (1965), 3311 Fairlawn Drive

Architect: Edward Larrabee Barnes (1915-)

School buildings constructed since 1965 are:

Lincoln Elementary School (1967), 750 Fifth Street

Architect: Gunnar Birkerts (1925-)

Southside Junior High School (1969), 1320 West Road 200 South
(Southside Elementary School)

Architect: Eliot Noyes (1910-1977)

L. Frances Smith Elementary School (1969), 4505 Waycross Drive

Architect: John M. Johansen (1916-)

Columbus East High School (1972), 230 S. Marr Road

Architect: Romaldo Guirgola (1920-), Mitchell-Guirgola

Mount Healthy Elementary School (1972), 12150 South SR 58

Hugh Hardy (1932-), Hardy Holzman Pfeiffer Associates

Fodrea Community School (1973), 2775 Illinois Street

Architects: Paul Kennon (1934-1990), Caudill Rowlett Scott

Clifty Creek Elementary School (1982) 4625 East 50 North

Architect: Richard Meier (1934-)

Hope Elementary School (1989), SR 9, Hope

Architect: Taft Architects

Though the community has generally been positive about the program, there has been occasional opposition, usually on the basis of cost. Some have questioned whether the foundation-supported schools have been more expensive to build than typical schools. In the early 1960s, school superintendent Dr. Clarence Robbins responded to taxpayer complaints with figures that showed that the cost of a recently constructed elementary school had been comparable to the statewide average for the year. Robbins stated, "It's hard to combat the notion that what is different or artistically superior has to be expensive. It

just isn't so, and we have the figures to prove it."⁸ An early 1970s, fiscally conservative school board elected to build a new school in Taylorsville, a town within the school district, without the help of Cummins Engine Foundation. Final cost figures suggested that little money had been saved by passing up a foundation architect. Taylorsville Elementary School is the only new school built outside the program since it began.

Some have also questioned the appearance of the foundation-supported schools. For example, though children were delighted with the concrete bunkers and brightly colored tubes of Frances Smith Elementary School, many adults objected. A common reaction in the early years of the program was, "But it doesn't look like a school." Nicknames illustrated this attitude. For example, Smith was called the "soybean factory" for its appearance as an industrial building surrounded by farmland; and Southside Junior High School was sometimes referred to as "the penitentiary" because of its massive concrete construction, characteristic of the "Brutalist" subtype of Modern architecture.

Outsiders have generally responded positively to the new school buildings. A *Christian Science Monitor* reporter stated in 1968, "Children in Columbus have the privilege of attending school in some of the most beautiful school buildings in the world - schools that say 'Now.'"⁹ Another publication suggested that the architecture had positively impacted students, citing that Columbus students had won more art show awards than students in any other Indiana town, and that 43 percent of students - twice the national average - were college-bound.¹⁰

School construction in the Columbus area was concentrated in the 1960s and early 70s, but fell off as supply caught up with demand. In the 1990s, a number of additions were built as the school population began to outgrow the district's capacity. When possible, the school board hired the original architect to design the addition. In some cases, architects have been unavailable or have declined to do the addition, and the school board has selected another architect. Additions have been built for the following schools:

Parkside Elementary School Addition (1990)

Original Architect: Norman Fletcher, The Architect's Collaborative

Addition Architect: Norman Fletcher, The Architect's Collaborative

Lillian C. Schmitt Elementary School Addition (1991)

Original Architect: Harry Weese

Addition Architect: Leers, Weinzapfel & Associates

Northside Junior High School Addition (1992)

Original Architect: Harry Weese

Architect: Leers, Weinzapfel & Associates

Clifty Creek Elementary School Addition (1997)

Original Architect: Richard Meier

Addition Architect: Stamberg Aferiat Architecture

W.D. Richards Elementary School Addition (1997)

Original Architect: Edward Larrabee Barnes

Addition Architect: John M.Y. Lee/Michael Timchula Architects

Design Consultant for Addition: Edward Larrabee Barnes

⁸ Grady Clay, "America Discovers Columbus," *Courier Journal Magazine*, 10 October 1965.

⁹ *Christian Science Monitor* (27 February 1968).

¹⁰ "America Discovers Columbus," *House and Garden*, July 1976.

L. Frances Smith Elementary School Addition (1997)

Original Architect: John M. Johansen

Addition Architect: Loeffler, Johansen, Bennett, Architects, P.C. with John M. Johansen

Columbus East High School Addition (1999)

Original Architect: Mitchell-Giurgola

Addition Architect: Mitchell-Giurgola

Expansion of Cummins Engine Foundation Program

In the late 1960s, Cummins Engine Foundation expanded its program to include all public buildings. Cummins and the foundation had supported public programs and buildings for several years (though not through a defined program as in the case of the schools). For example, in 1963, the foundation had made a donation of \$125,000 for an expansion of the Boys Club and Girls Club. The same year, Cummins Engine Company gave to the community Otter Creek Golf Course, designed by Robert Trent Jones, with a clubhouse by Harry Weese and landscape design by Dan Kiley.

In 1966, the foundation offered to pay the design fee for the proposed Bartholomew County Children's Home if an architect were selected as the school architects were selected. The offer was considered but turned down because a local firm had already designed the new facility and prepared plans. This led the editor of the Columbus newspaper to wonder about the foundation's view of local architects: "There is still another question to be considered, the question of whether all local architects, if qualified and capable, should be ruled out automatically in the construction of public buildings here. If the answer is 'No,' then the Cummins Foundation program should be an inspiration for them to strive for better and better work."¹¹

The first public building that the foundation supported as it had educational buildings (i.e. paid the architect's fee if the architect was selected from a list developed by a panel) was Fire Station No. 4, designed by Robert Venturi, and completed in 1967. From that time on, nearly all new public buildings in Columbus made use of the foundation's program, including fire stations, the post office, health care facilities, recreational facilities, the city hall, public housing, the county jail, a branch library, and a youth center. (The foundation also made a contribution for the construction of Cleo Rogers Memorial Library after the library board had, on its own initiative, selected I.M. Pei as the architect.) Public buildings supported through Cummins Engine Foundation include:

Fire Station No. 4 (1967), 4730 25th Street

Architect: Robert Venturi (1925-)

Cleo Rogers Memorial Library (1969), 536 Fifth Street

Architect: I.M. Pei (1917-)

Columbus Post Office (1970), 450 Jackson Street

Architect: Kevin Roche (1922-), John Dinkeloo (1918-1981), Roche Dinkeloo & Associates

Quinco Consulting Center (1972), 2975 Lincoln Park Drive

(Columbus Regional Hospital Mental Health Center)

Architect: James Stewart Polshek (1930-)

Par 3 Golf Course Clubhouse (1972), Fairlawn at Par 3 Drive

¹¹ "The Architects," *The Evening Republican* (6 January 1966).

Architect: Bruce Adams

Columbus City Hall (1981), 123 Washington Street

Architect: Charles Edward Bassett (1921-1999), Skidmore Owings & Merrill

Sycamore Place (1982), 222 Sycamore Place (Public Housing)

Architect: Charles Gwathmey (1938-), Gwathmey Siegel & Associates

Pence Place Apartments (1984), Pence Street (Public Housing)

Architect: Charles Gwathmey (1938-), Gwathmey Siegel & Associates Architects

Fire Station No. 5 (1987), 100 Goeller Court

Architect: Susana Torre (1944-), Wank Adams Slavin Associates

Bartholomew County Jail (1990), 350 2nd Street

Architect: Don Hisaka

Columbus Regional Hospital (1992), 2400 E. 17th Street

Architect: Robert A.M. Stern (1939-), Robert A.M. Stern Architects with Falik Klein Partnership

Mill Race Park Structures (1992), 50 5th Street

Architect: Stanley Saitowitz

Fire Station No. 6 (1998), SR 58 & I-65

Architect: William Rawn

Hope Library (1998), 638 Main Street, Hope

Architect: Deborah Berke

Foundation for Youth (1998), 400 N. Cherry Street

Architect: Michael Shirley, Hellmuth Obata + Kassabaum

Patronage of Other Design Disciplines

In addition to buildings, the foundation has supported landscape architecture and urban design projects. Under the foundation's building program, landscape design for individual buildings is the responsibility of the architect. Many outstanding landscapes have been developed for foundation-supported building projects. Examples include Dan Kiley's designs for Schmitt (1957) and W.D. Richards (1965) elementary schools, and Jack Curtis' designs for Foundation for Youth (1998) and Fire Station No. 6 (1998).

In addition, Cummins Engine Foundation has also supported park and open space improvements, including Michael Van Valkenburgh's designs for Mill Race Park (1992) and Bartholomew County Courthouse Square (1993). Streetscape Improvement projects in 1990 and 1993 for downtown Columbus were designed by Paul Kennon of CRSSirrine in association with Michael Van Valkenburgh. Most recently, the Columbus Alley walkway was designed by William A. Johnson and completed in 1998.

Urban design and planning studies have also been funded by the Foundation (sometimes in partnership with other local foundations). These studies include:

- 1968 Columbus, Indiana Central Area Plan
Skidmore, Owings & Merrill in association with Sasaki, Dawson, DeMay Associates and Barton-Aschman Associates
- 1983 Columbus, Indiana Central Area Master Plan

- Skidmore, Owings & Merrill in association with Barton-Aschman Associates
- 1988 Some Community Ideas
Paul Kennon, CRSSirrine
 - 1996 Downtown Design Charrette
William A. Johnson

All of the plans developed recommendations for the placement and infill of public buildings and resources, and the character and design of public streets, walkways, and parks. Many of these recommendations have been implemented.

Support by Other Columbus Foundations

It should be noted that Columbus has a number of corporate foundations that have not only supported the city's image of architectural excellence, but have contributed in other ways to improving the quality of life for its residents. Q.G. Noblitt, founder of Arvin Industries, was an early supporter of education and youth activities. He was largely responsible for the Foundation for Youth, established in 1928. One of the first organizations of its type in the nation, the foundation was an umbrella for the Boys Club and Girls Club and the 70-acre (now 115-acre) Youth Camp. The Arvin Foundation has continued to support a variety of community programs associated with youth, education, the arts, and other areas. In the late 1980s, the company rehabilitated and expanded a historic school building as its headquarters. The architect for this project was William A. Browne, Jr. (1955-), of Ratio Architects.

COSCO, Inc. and the associated Hamilton Foundation have also been important in the development of Columbus. Lincoln Center (now Hamilton Center Ice Arena), designed by Harry Weese and completed in 1958, was a gift from the foundation to the community. Weese also designed an office building for the company. This facility, completed in 1962, included site and landscape design by Dan Kiley.

The Irwin-Sweeney-Miller Foundation, a family foundation, is another organization that has contributed significantly to the community. The foundation supported the design of a model block of Washington Street storefronts by Alexander Girard in the 1960s.

Other community projects and plans have been made possible by local businesses, foundations, and individuals. For example, the 1983 Columbus Central Area Master Plan received funding from Cummins Engine Foundation, First National Bank, Heritage Fund of Bartholomew County, Irwin Management Company, Inc., and Irwin Union Foundation. The Commons (1973), an enclosed civic space designed by Cesar Pelli, was a gift of Mr. and Mrs. J. Irwin Miller and Mrs. Robert Tangeman. Mr. and Mrs. Miller have commissioned works of sculpture, including Henry Moore's "Large Arch" (1971) for the Library plaza, Jean Tinguely's "Chaos I" (1974) for the Commons; and Dale Chihuly's "Yellow Neon Chandelier" (1995) for the Visitors Center.

Private Commissions

The many private architectural commissions reveal the influence of the Cummins Engine Foundation program, and the acceptance of the community of its identity as an architectural center. As this image grew, many companies, institutions, and individuals commissioned critically acclaimed architects to design buildings.

Irwin Union Bank - whose main building, designed by Eero Saarinen and completed in 1954, pre-dated the Cummins Engine Foundation program – built several branches as the community and its business expanded. These were the Hope Branch (1958), designed by Harry Weese; Eastbrook Plaza Branch (1961), designed by Harry Weese; the State Street Branch (c.1965), designed by Harry Weese; the Taylorsville Branch (1966), designed by Fisher and Spillman; and the State and Mapleton Branch (1974), designed by Paul Kennon.

Cummins Engine Company also used leading architects for several projects, hiring Harry Weese for the design of Cummins Technical Center (1968); Bruce Adams for Cummins Engine Company Warehouse (c.1970); Hardy Holzman Pfeiffer for Cummins Occupational Health Center (1973); and Roche Dinkeloo and Associates for Cummins Midrange Engine Plant (1973), Cummins Engine Company Corporate Office Building (1983), and an addition to Cummins main plant (1998). Sometimes the scope of these private projects contributed to the civic realm, such as the landscape design for Haw Creek Boulevard by Dan Kiley, which was done in association with the Cummins Technical Center project by Harry Weese.

Among other businesses that contributed to Columbus' image was the city's long-time newspaper, *The Republic*. The company's 1971 building was designed by Myron Goldsmith (1918-1996) of Skidmore, Owings, and Merrill. Indiana Bell commissioned Caudill Rowlett Scott to design its Switching Center (1978, now Ameritech Switching Center). Breeden Realtors 1995 office building was designed by Hammond Beeby and Babka.

Ecclesiastical structures included North Christian Church (1964), designed by Eero Saarinen with Dan Kiley providing landscape design; First Baptist Church (1965), designed by Harry Weese; and St. Peter's Lutheran Church (1988), designed by Gunnar Birkerts. Norman Fletcher of The Architect's Collaborative designed Four Seasons Retirement Center (1967), a complex of apartments, a chapel, and a health care facility.

The Irwin Management Company is a local development firm that is part of the Miller family interests. In the early 1970s, the company established Tipton Lakes, a planned community, with design assistance from David Crane, a landplanner from Philadelphia. Tipton Lakes has become a desirable place to live in Columbus because of its continuous open space and path system, its boulevarded streets, and community design controls. Many innovative architectural designs have also been commissioned for individual homes and cluster areas. While this development is not part of the official patronage program, the Miller family's belief in excellent design created this example of good design and landplanning as a standard for the Columbus area. Tipton Lakes has been recognized as one of the best residential and recreational communities in America.¹²

Governmental Commissions

In recent years, the architectural aesthetic of the community has influenced governmental choice in the selection of designers for large-scale transportation and park design. These multi-disciplinary projects have been funded by public funding, grants, and sometimes the local foundations. Such projects include Mill Race Park, a city project, for which the landscape architect was Michael Van Valkenburg in association with architect Stanley Saitowitz. In addition, the City influenced the Indiana Department of Transportation (INDOT) to seek innovative design for an integrated "Front Door" to the community. Selection of the design team, which included transportation planners, architects, landscape architects, and engineers, took place within the context of an INDOT consultant selection process. The City assembled a public/private client group, which demanded a unique solution to the design problem of how to create a unique interstate entry to a community.¹³ Both the state and federal governments recognize that Columbus seeks the best design solution, and doesn't go about governmental projects in quite the same way as other Indiana cities and towns. This heritage of the architectural patronage program has established itself as a way of doing business for the City of Columbus.

¹² Lester J. Giese, et al, *The 99 Best Residential and Recreational Communities in America*, 1991.

¹³ Meg Storrow and John Kinsella, "The Leveraging of Infrastructure Renewal to Create an Interstate Front Door," *1997 Annual Meeting Proceedings*, Edited by Cheryl Wagner (Washington, D.C.: American Society of Landscape Architects, 1997).

National Recognition

Corporate support of public architecture has had a major impact on Columbus and Bartholomew County. In the words of a 1975 American Institute of Architects Citation to Cummins Engine Foundation: “The foundation’s efforts have made Columbus an architectural showcase and perhaps the best possible example of how architecture can improve the physical environment and quality of life.”¹⁴

National publications such as *Architectural Forum* and *House and Garden* began to notice Columbus as early as the 1950s. The city’s now famous nickname, “Athens of the Prairie,” first appeared as the title of a Saturday Evening Post article in 1964.¹⁵ Other major publications that sent reporters to Columbus in the 1960s included the *Wall Street Journal*, the *Washington Post*, the *Christian Science Monitor* and *Life*. Columbus was first written about by architecture and design critics, but soon became of interest to travel journalists writing for newspapers and magazines throughout the country.

Lady Bird Johnson’s visit to Columbus as part of her Crossroads USA Tour in 1967 dramatically increased the city’s exposure to the national press.¹⁶ Guests at a dinner held in honor of the first lady’s visit – including most of the designers whose work was represented in the city - probably expanded the media’s interest: Edward Larrabee Barnes, Gunnar Birkerts, Norman Fletcher, Alexander Girard, John Johansen, Dan Kiley, Ehrman Mitchell, Romaldo Giurgola, Elliot Noyes, I.M. Pei, Kenneth Carruthers, John Dinkeloo, Kevin Roche, Robert Venturi, John Carl Warnecke, and Harry Weese. Mrs. Aline Saarinen was also present to represent her deceased husband Eero.

Local residents became increasingly aware of the interest in Columbus in the 1960s as architectural tourists began to visit. In 1968, the Chamber of Commerce produced a brochure that listed 31 architectural resources. By the time the Visitors Center opened in the historic Storey House in 1973, the city was receiving several thousand visitors each year. A bus donated by Cummins Engine Company made guided tours possible. (Current figures for the number of tourists who visit Columbus each year are estimated to be around 50,000 by Visitors Center staff.)

Further evidence of acceptance of Columbus as an architectural center was seen in the selection of the city as the site for the 1974 Association of Student Chapters of the American Institute of Architects annual conference. Over 500 students representing 32 universities and colleges, as well as architects and educators, attended the conference. Columbus continues to be a destination for thousands of student visitors each year from colleges and universities.

The city was profiled in the September 1978 issue of *National Geographic*. Several pages of the magazine were devoted to images of Columbus’ Modern architecture. Included in the accompanying narrative was the observation: “For townspeople the forty-plus buildings designed by modern masters of architecture do not make a spectator sport. They are places to learn in, pray in, read in, have fun in, work in, bank in, have daily life of the community written and printed in. Small town in scale, they fit in like slightly eccentric neighbors, adding variety, provoking debate, and stimulating a taste for the unconventional.”¹⁷

Several other high honors have been paid to Columbus. An exhibit on its Modern architecture, “Good Design and the Community” was featured at the National Building Museum in Washington, D.C. from October 1986 to January 1987. Columbus was voted sixth – after Chicago, New York, San Francisco, Boston and Washington, D.C. – among “Top 10 American Cities for Architectural Quality and

¹⁴ *A Look at Architecture: Columbus, Indiana* (Columbus: Visitor’s Center, 1998).

¹⁵ Walt McCaslin, “Athens of the Prairie,” *Saturday Evening Post* (21 March 1964).

¹⁶ *The Republic*, Columbus, Indiana (11 June 1968).

¹⁷ Jeffery, David, “A Most Uncommon Town, Columbus.” *National Geographic* (September 1978).

Innovation” in a 1991 American Institute of Architects survey. (In the Whitney Guide to 20th Century American Architecture, Columbus was ranked fourth – after New York, Chicago, and Los Angeles – in terms of the number of buildings designed by noted architects.”¹⁸) Columbus was selected as the location for the Pritzker Architecture Prize award ceremony in 1992.¹⁹

Widespread recognition for Columbus’ architecture is evidenced by the many articles about the city and its buildings, including the following examples:

- John Morris Dixon of *Architectural Forum* called Columbus’ buildings a “remarkable collection of architecture.” (*Architectural Forum*, December 1965)
- Ruth Moore of the *Chicago Sun-Times* wrote, “No other small city and no other large one, except possibly Chicago, can boast such a collection of public and private buildings by such a representative group of leading architects.” (*Chicago Sunday Sun-Times*, 6 August 1966)
- A British publication stated that Columbus had “one of the world’s greatest collections of contemporary architecture.” (*Architectural Review*, July 1967)
- Bill Thomas of the *New York Times* wrote, “Seldom if ever, has so small a community contained so many examples of innovative architectural achievement.” (*New York Times*, 22 March 1970)
- Another *New York Times* article stated, “Columbus probably has the finest architecture per capita of any city in the United States.” (*New York Times*, 17 May 1971)
- Paul Goldberger wrote in *New York Times Magazine*, “As groups of buildings by distinguished architects go . . . there is no place in the U.S. equal to Columbus.” (*New York Times Magazine*, 26 April 1981)

The architecture and landscape architecture of Columbus and Bartholomew County have received numerous awards. A partial list of these is on the last page of this context statement. Among honors and awards that reflect overall accomplishments in community design are:

- Commemorative plaque by Mrs. Lyndon B. Johnson for recognition of the community’s architectural progress (1967)
- Total Design Award to the City of Columbus from the National Society of Interior Designers (1970)
- Indiana Arts Commission Award to the Board of School Trustees for “accepting the challenge of the community to build better schools” (1973)
- Citation to Cummins Engine Foundation from the American Institute of Architects (1975)
- “Good Design and the Community,” Exhibit on Columbus Architecture, National Building Museum (1986-87)

Columbus has received its share of criticism as well as praise. In 1976, in an otherwise generally positive article, *Chicago Tribune* architectural critic Paul Gapp pointed out “mixed results” in downtown, stated that Southside Junior High School looked like FBI Headquarters, and called East High School a suburban industrial plant. Gapp also complained that Columbus was no different than other places in regards to “visual clutter.”²⁰

Inadequate planning to relate buildings to each other was also a frequent comment of urban design critics. In a 1980 *AIA Journal* article, for example, Allen Freeman cited a “lack of planning to knit together

¹⁸ Whitney Library of Design, *Whitney Guide to 20th Century American Architecture* (New York: Whitney Library of Design, 1993).

¹⁹ The Pritzker is the top international architectural prize. Pritzker prize winners who have designed buildings in Columbus are Richard Meier, I.M. Pei, Kevin Roche, and Robert Venturi.

²⁰ Paul Gapp, “Discovering Columbus,” *Chicago Tribune Magazine* (22 August 1976).

pieces.”²¹ Ellen Posner echoed this concern in the *Wall Street Journal* in 1984, stating a need for a visual sequence of buildings; and trees, streets, and open spaces that work together to create a fabric.”²²

Criticisms such as these led the city to expand urban design and planning efforts. The community passed landscape and signage ordinances in 1996 and 1997 that have significantly reduced the “visual clutter” in the right-of-ways. The City also improved downtown by the addition of a streetscape along Washington Street and corridor improvements to Fifth Street, connecting the downtown to Mill Race Park. These efforts have resulted in significant connectivity improvements that enhance the collection of buildings. In 1996, Grady Clay wrote, “Originally there was no grand design to Columbus . . . Some of the name buildings, mostly downtown, are only now beginning to become part of an ensemble.”²³ Clay also lauded the city’s efforts in several other areas: adaptive use of historic buildings; the design of a new “Gateway” entrance from Interstate 65; and expansion of the designed urban landscape beyond individual properties.

Other Programs Inspired by the Success of the Columbus Architectural Patronage Program

The results of architectural patronage in Columbus have inspired other programs to some degree. In 1974 the Columbus newspaper, *The Republic*, reported on a program in Flint, Michigan, in operation since 1962, that had been inspired by the Cummins Engine Foundation program.²⁴ The Flint program, known as “Flint Architectural Community Excellence” started in 1962 and was sponsored by the DeWaters Charitable Trust. Projects supported by the trust included Doyle-Ryder School, an historic school building with a new classroom wing designed by Hodne/Stageberg Partners and completed in 1980.

During the 1990s, the University of Cincinnati hired notable architects to design several new buildings. Michael Graves designed the Engineering Research Center (1995); Peter Eisenman was the architect for the Aronoff Center for Design and Art (1996); and Frank Gehry designed the Vontz Center for Molecular Studies (1999). Much of the credit for the university’s new buildings may be given to Jay Chattergee, Dean of the College of Design, Art, Architecture, and Planning. Chattergee, who was inspired by the architectural program in Columbus, encouraged Cincinnati city officials to follow the university’s example. As a result, public buildings designed by Cesar Pelli, Michael Graves and Zaha Hadid have been constructed in other parts of Cincinnati.

For Celebration, Florida, the Disney Corporation’s planned community established in 1994, a number of nationally known architects were hired to design key buildings. These included Michael Graves (Celebration Post Office), Philip Johnson (Celebration Town Hall), Graham Gund (Celebration Hotel), Venturi Scott-Brown (Sun Trust Bank), Cesar Pelli (AMC Theater), and Robert Stern (Celebration Health), and landscape architects EDAW as master planners for the Community.

Other programs that predated the one in Columbus included IBM’s and the U.S. State Department’s policies of hiring notable architects to design facilities. Architects who have been hired by IBM include Marcel Breuer (buildings in Boca Raton, Florida and La Gaude, France), Eliot Noyes (Hamden, Connecticut), Donald Coupard (Harrisburg, Pennsylvania), Carl Petrelli (Hawthorne, New York), Edward Larrabee Barnes (Mount Pleasant, New York), Eero Saarinen (Rochester, Minnesota and Yorktown Heights, New York), and Minoru Yamasaki (Seattle, Washington).

A few of the architects who have designed United States embassies are Edward Charles Bassett (USSR), Marcel Breuer (Netherlands), Walter Gropius (Greece), The Architects Collaborative (Cuba), Neutra and

²¹ Allen Freeman, *AIA Journal* (March 1980).

²² Ellen Posner, *Wall Street Journal* (16 January 1984).

²³ Grady Clay, “Discovering Columbus,” *Landscape Architecture* (June 1996).

²⁴ James Gilmore, “Michigan City ‘Inspired’ by Local Architectural Program,” *The Republic* (14 August 1974).

Alexander (Pakistan), Paul Rudolph (Jordan), Eero Saarinen (Norway and England), Edward Durell Stone (India), John Carl Warnecke (Thailand), and Harry Weese (Ghana).

Indiana Historic Sites and Structures Inventory

Even 20 years ago, there was recognition by the State Historic Preservation Office of the significance of Columbus' Modern buildings. The Indiana Historic Sites and Structures Inventory completed a survey of Columbus and Bartholomew County in 1979 that included several of these buildings. The Republic (1971) was given a rating of "outstanding" (potentially eligible for listing on the National Register). A number of other buildings were identified as contributing to a potential historic district, including: First Christian Church (1942), Irwin Union Bank and Trust (1954), Lincoln Elementary School (1967), Cleo Rogers Memorial Library (1969), and The Commons/Courthouse Center (1973). This historic district, which comprises the city's downtown and surrounding residential area, was listed on the National Register in 1982. The district that was ultimately listed included First Christian Church (1942) as a contributing resource.

Awards and Honors Relating to Bartholomew County Architecture and Landscape Architecture (Partial List)

Bartholomew Consolidated School Corporation

- Indiana Arts Commission Award to the Board of School Trustees for "accepting the challenge of the community to build better schools" (1973)

City of Columbus

- Commemorative plaque by Mrs. Lyndon B. Johnson for recognition of the community's architectural progress (1967)
- Total Design Award to the City of Columbus from the National Society of Interior Designers (1970)
- "Good Design and the Community" (Exhibit on Columbus Architecture) National Building Museum (1986-87)

Cummins Engine Foundation

- Citation to Cummins Engine Foundation from the American Institute of Architects (1975)

Mr. and Mrs. J. Irwin Miller

- Recognition by the Indiana Association of Nurserymen: Leadership and foresight in improving the environment through landscaping (1972)
- Thomas Jefferson Award, American Society of Interior Design (1979)
- National Governors Award for Distinguished Service to the Arts (1980)
- Indiana Arts Award: Outstanding contribution to the creative process in America (1981)
- Mayor's Art Award (with Mrs. Clementine Tangeman and Miss Elsie I. Sweeney): Outstanding contributions to the growth, development and enjoyment of the arts in Columbus (1983)
- Landscape Architecture Foundation Award and Landscape Architects Urban Parks Honor Roll (1995)

Mrs. J. Irwin Miller

- Distinguished Achievement Award, Columbus Area Chamber of Commerce (1975)
- Sagamore of the Wabash, by Governor Otis Bowen for work with the Indiana Arts Commission (1975)

Mr. J. Irwin Miller

- Fellow, American Academy of Arts and Sciences
- Honorary Fellow, American Institute of Architects
- Honorary Fellow, Royal Institute of British Architects
- Benjamin Franklin Fellow, The Royal Society of Arts
- McDowell Colony Award: given to a corporate executive who has made an outstanding contribution to the creative process in America (1981)
- First Inductee, National Building Hall of Fame: Recognition of unique lifetime commitment to improving the quality of life in Columbus (1986)
- Tiffany Award: Outstanding leadership in the field of American Design (1971)
- Conover Memorial Award, Guild for Religious Architecture (1969)
- Member of the Jury for the Pritzker Architecture Prize
- Humanitarian Award, National Recreation and Park Association: Leadership in encouraging civic improvements in Columbus (1970)

Arvin Industries Company Headquarters

- American Society of Landscape Architects, Indiana Chapter, Merit Award (1991)

Bartholomew County Veterans Memorial

- Tucker Award of Excellence, National Building Stone Institute (1998)

Columbus Municipal Airport

- American Society of Landscape Architects, Indiana Chapter, Merit Award for Bakalar Entryway Concept (1991)

Columbus East High School

- Gold Medal, Philadelphia Chapter American Institute of Architects (1974)
- Honor Award, American Institute of Architects (1975)

Cummins Occupational Health Association

- Honor Award, American Institute of Architects (1976)
- Bartlett Award, President's Committee for the Handicapped and American Institute of Architects (1976)

Cummins Engine Company Corporate Office Building

- Honor Award, American Society of Landscape Architects, Indiana Chapter (1991)

Cummins Midrange Engine Plant

- Museum of Modern Art Exhibit (1970)

Fairlawn Presbyterian Church

- Special Recognition Award for Site Master Plan, American Society of Landscape Architects, Indiana Chapter (1990)

First Presbyterian Church, Columbarium Memorial Garden (1989)

- Honor Award and President's Award, American Society of Landscape Architects, Indiana Chapter (1989)

Fodrea Elementary School

- Outstanding Design Award of the American Association of School Administrators (1972)
- Award of Excellence, American Iron and Steel Institute (1975)

- Honor Award, Texas Society of Architects (1975)
- Award of Excellence, American Institute of Steel Construction (1975)
- Award of Merit, Southern California Chapter, American Institute of Architects (1975)

Franklin Square

- Certificate of Merit, American Association of Nurserymen (1971)

Gateway Arch Bridge (1998)

- Award of Excellence, Federal Highway Administration (1998)
- Most Innovative Structure, Annual Excellence in Structural Engineering Design Competition, Structural Engineers Association of Illinois (1998)
- Outstanding Engineering Achievement Award, Indiana Society of Professional Engineers (1998)
- Merit Award, American Institute of Steel Construction
- Outstanding Achievement Award for Concrete Construction, Indiana Ready Mixed Concrete Association

Hope Elementary School

- Excellence in Masonry Design, Masonry Institute of America (1991)

Indiana Bell Switching Station

- *Progressive Architecture* Design Award (1979)
- Honor Award, American Institute of Architects (1980)
- Honor Award, Texas Society of Architects (1979)
- Award of Excellence, American Institute of Steel Construction (1980)
- Honorable Mention, AT & T Building Awards Program (1979)

Irwin Union Bank and Trust

- Certificate of Merit, American Association of Nurserymen (1971)

Irwin Union Bank and Trust, State and Mapleton Streets Branch

- Honor Award, Texas Society of Architects (1975)
- Interior Architecture Honor Award, Texas Society of Architects (1979)

Lincoln Elementary School

- Honor Award, American Institute of Architects (1968)
- Honor Award, Detroit Chapter, American Institute of Architects (1968)
- School of the Month Award, National Council on Schoolhouse Construction (1967)

Mill Race Park

- Outstanding New U.S. Park, *Architectural Record* (1993)
- Development Award, Indiana Park and Recreation Association (1993)
- Design Merit Award, American Institute of Landscape Architects (1994)

Mount Healthy Elementary School

- Exhibition of School Architecture Commemorative Plaque, American Association of School Administration and American Institute of Architects (1973)
- Exhibit at the National Institute of Arts and Letters (1974)

North Christian Church (1964)

- American Society of Landscape Architects Centennial Medallion (1999)

The Republic

- Honor Award, American Institute of Architects (1975)
- First Place Award, Plant Planning Competition of the *American Press Magazine* (1971)
- Design in Steel Award of the American Iron and Steel Institute (1973)

Sandy Hook United Methodist Church

- Design Award, Indiana Society of Architects (1974)

MODERN ARCHITECTURE AND LANDSCAPE ARCHITECTURE IN BARTHOLOMEW COUNTY, 1942-1965

The type of design known as “Modern,” though developed over a period of several decades, had only received limited acceptance in the United States by the 1940s, and was not prevalent until the 1950s. When the term Modern first came into use, it referred to new structures that had certain features: simple designs, integration of all elements of design, rectilinear forms, use of the latest materials, exposed structure, little or no ornamentation, largely open plans, and spaces based on function rather than aesthetic considerations. Modernism looked forward rather than back, stressing the functional aspects of contemporary life. It was collaborative and concerned about social welfare and environmentalism. “Modernism” made it possible to eliminate the preconceived design vocabularies and to develop forms and arrangements that spoke to specific sites, clients, users, local contexts and regional cultures.

Since 1942, over 60 buildings, structures and numerous other resources have been designed for Columbus by the country’s leading practitioners in architecture, landscape architecture, and urban design. Associated with the buildings and landscapes are significant works of public sculpture and commissioned works of art intended for specific locations. In addition, many of the buildings have furnishings that were designed by leading designers for specific interiors. The result has been an extraordinary representation of late twentieth century design. Columbus is distinctive in the United States in this way. Though some towns, businesses and universities have made a similar attempt, nowhere has the effort been as comprehensive as in Columbus. The works are integrated into the community as schools, factories, office buildings, churches, government buildings, parks, bridges, and homes and gardens.

The effort does not appear to have focused on developing a comprehensive collection of works by a select group of designers, nor does there appear to have been an attempt to commission work by specific designers simply to have their work represented. Rather, the effort grew out of a very pragmatic response to the needs of a rapidly growing community, and an acceptance of the Modernist tenet that one of the roles of design was to address and solve problems. (Please see the Historic Context Statement “Patronage in Public Architecture” for an explanation of the origins of the effort in Columbus.)

The Modern movement has evolved into the architecture of the present day. Variations on the Modern architectural style reflect the influence of the early Modern masters. For example, followers of Frank Lloyd Wright leaned toward a more organic architecture, while those inspired by Walter Gropius revealed a preference for machine-made buildings. As the movement progressed, buildings became more sculptural and expressive. Many Modern buildings constructed after about 1970 employed historical references. These buildings retained essential elements of Modernism and formed a subtype referred to as “Postmodern.” For the purpose of this discussion, Modernism in architecture in Columbus will be defined as the works built between the years 1942 and 1999 that espouse simple design, integration of design elements, exposed structure, innovative materials and/or techniques, and creative interior configuration based on function. As a group, Modern buildings in the Columbus area represent the development of American architecture since the mid-twentieth century. The buildings reflect current trends at the time they were constructed, and incorporate urban responses, planning models, and materials

that were considered most appropriate at the time. The buildings in Columbus were designed by architects who had a significant role in shaping the direction of American architecture over the past 60 years.

In some cases, the architects received their Columbus commissions early in their careers, and have gone on to produce larger and more famous works elsewhere. This is true of Robert Venturi (1925-) whose Fire Station Number 4 (1967) is a significant early work that is eclipsed by more recent buildings such as the Sainsbury Wing of the National Gallery in London (1991). Hardy Holzman Pfeiffer Associates is another example. Cummins Occupational Health Association (1973) was an early work of the firm, which later designed such well-known edifices as Orchestra Hall (1974) in Minneapolis and the renovation of the Los Angeles County Museum (1986).

Most of the architects have designed one building in Columbus, but a few have been asked to return several times. Harry Weese, for example, worked in the city off and on from 1951 to 1968. He designed at least 18 buildings, including commercial and industrial buildings, schools, houses, and a church. Paul Kennon, whose first exposure to Columbus was as an assistant to Eero Saarinen on North Christian Church, returned to work on Irwin Union Bank's State Street Branch (1974), the Indiana Bell Switching Center (1978), and the downtown streetscape (1990). Kevin Roche is another architect whose career is well represented in Columbus, from the early 1950s when he served as assistant to Eero Saarinen on Irwin Union Bank to the 1990s when he designed an addition to Cummins Engine Company's main plant.

The first period of development related to the Modern Architecture Context extended from 1942 to 1965, a period of rapid population growth and one in which many new buildings were required. Roughly one-third of the resources associated with the context were built during this time.

It is appropriate to evaluate the buildings of this context within the time period of 1942-1965. The first date represents the beginnings of Modern architecture in Columbus. The late 1960s and 70s was a transitional period during which a new subtype of Modernism, known as "Post-Modern Classical" began. This subtype may be seen in the first public building of the second period, Fire Station No. 4 (1967), designed by Robert Venturi. In the later period, there was also greater attention to the relationships between the user and the building, and between the building and its urban setting than had typified the work of earlier decades.

Columbus Architecture to 1942

Prior to about 1940, Columbus' built environment was similar to many other Indiana county seats. An 1886 bird's eye view shows it to have been a town of frame and brick buildings. The most prominent edifices were the churches and public buildings. Downtown consisted of a few blocks of two and three story commercial buildings lining Washington Street.

Several notable buildings were constructed near the end of the nineteenth century. The most significant of these was the Bartholomew County Courthouse (1874), a fine Second Empire structure designed by Isaac Hodgson, one of a small number of professionally trained architects in Indiana at the time. Between about 1880 and 1900, several schools, churches, commercial buildings, residences, and public buildings, including the 1895 City Hall, were designed by Charles Sparrell, a professional architect who came to Columbus from Boston. Sparrell worked comfortably in the Italianate, Queen Anne, and Romanesque Revival styles.

Elmer Dunlap, a Columbus native who worked with Sparrell for a time, was responsible for many of the city's early twentieth century buildings, including St. Peter's Lutheran Church (1903), a Gothic Revival style building, and Central School (1904), a Neoclassical style building.

As was the case in many places, Columbus' first taste of Modern architectural design came in the form of a movie theater. The Mode (1936), designed by William Pereira of Chicago, was a small theater with a Moderne façade. This was followed by the Crump Theater remodeling (Alden Meranda, 1941) and Central Fire Station (Leighton Bowers, 1941), both examples of the Moderne style.

The most important building constructed in Columbus in the first half of the twentieth century was the First Christian Church, completed in 1942. Designed by Eliel Saarinen, a leading architect of the Modern movement, the building was one of the first churches in the United States of a non-historical design. The building is an internationally recognized work of architecture. Locally it represents the beginnings of Columbus' association with outstanding Modern architecture.

Overview of Modern Architecture in the United States

Modern architecture, as it developed in the United States and Europe during the early years of the twentieth century, had roots in the nineteenth century. The Industrial Revolution transformed building materials, as well as the means by which they were produced. The Arts and Crafts movement recognized that objects were being fabricated efficiently through new means of production, but lacked aesthetic value. Members of this movement sought to realign the means of production with design, rejecting the intervention of machines, and embracing craft and handwork.

The early Modernists sought to maintain the intellectual relationship between the object and its means of design and production. Instead of rejecting the machine, they embraced it, basing a new aesthetic on the designs of machines and the work of engineers. Modernism became, by the end of the 1920s, a clearly identifiable style, particularly as practiced in Europe. The buildings that conformed to the style were declared by their designers to be objective and rational responses to the work at hand. This attitude was represented by such buildings as the Bauhaus (1927), designed by Walter Gropius, and Villa Savoye (1927), designed by Le Corbusier.

These buildings and others were grouped together by Henry-Russell Hitchcock and Philip Johnson in the 1932 exhibit, "The International Style" at the Museum of Modern Art in New York, and in a book of the same title. The buildings and architects selected for the show shared the theoretical and formal precepts defined by Hitchcock and Johnson. These were, first, a new conception of architecture as volume rather than as mass. Secondly, regularity rather than axial symmetry served as the chief means of ordering design. These two principles, with a third proscribing arbitrarily applied decoration, mark the productions of the International Style. Along with the formal sensibility thus summarized was a belief that architecture should be an expression of function, divorced from subjective decisions. Many architects even went so far as to deny that aesthetic decisions were present in their work.

Frank Lloyd Wright (1867-1959) had been purposely omitted from the book The International Style. He did not fit the formula of the new architecture, but it is indisputable that his work was highly influential, both in Europe and the United States, and was an important factor in the development of Modern architecture.

By the late 1930s, Modern architecture in the United States had developed differently than in Europe. Largely home grown, with heterogeneous roots in the Chicago school, the Arts and Crafts movement and the Beaux-Arts style, Modern architecture in the United States was not much given to polemics or didactic pronouncement. It was dominated by architects such as George Howe and William Le Scaze (Philadelphia Savings Fund Society Building, 1932), Raymond Hood (Rockefeller Center, 1940), and Richard Neutra (Lovell Health House, 1929). Of these, only Neutra was closely aligned stylistically with contemporary developments in Europe.

Another school of American Modernism came into being in the late 1930s with the immigration of Walter Gropius (1883-1969), his student Marcel Breuer (1902-1981), and Ludwig Mies van der Rohe (1886-1969), all fleeing the war and social upheaval in Germany. Prior to their arrival, all three were well known in the United States within the avant-garde community. Gropius and Breuer immediately received a number of commissions, and Gropius and Mies van der Rohe became directors of schools of architecture. Gropius became director of the Harvard Graduate School of Design, and Mies van der Rohe became director of the Armor Institute of Technology, later the Illinois Institute of Technology (IIT). With them came the rigorous intellectual form of Modernism celebrated in *The International Style* (1932). Through the influence of their positions and the persuasiveness of their designs, by the early 1950s, Gropius, Breuer, Mies and their followers defined the Modern style in the United States, particularly in corporate and institutional work.

Eliel Saarinen, a native of Finland, was more closely affiliated with the American group than the Europeans. Saarinen began practice in the 1890s in Finland where his work, which combined craft, design and modern technology, was profoundly influential. Finland was a Russian province at the time, and the Romantic Nationalist style he created was an integral expression of nascent Finnish Nationalism. In the early years of the century Saarinen's work was very closely related to that of Peter Behrens in Germany and Hendrik Petrus Berlage in Holland and was recognized and highly respected throughout Europe. Saarinen's great genius lay in the integration of structural form with well-crafted elements and highly originally ornament to create beautifully scaled and integrated structures.

In 1922, Saarinen placed second in the Chicago Tribune Tower Competition. On the strength of this success and other prospects, he left his prosperous practice and immigrated to the United States. Though he lost the Tribune Tower competition, this losing entry was for many years his most influential work. His design established a new way of organizing the façade of a skyscraper in which the strong verticals of the shaft rose from a simple base to terminate, after several small setbacks, in a modestly ornamented top section. The Tribune Tower design directly influenced skyscraper design through the end of 1930s.

In 1924, after some time in Chicago and Ann Arbor, Saarinen settled near Detroit at the invitation of George G. Booth to work on the development and construction of the school of art and architecture known as Cranbrook Academy of Art. The campus that Saarinen designed and built between 1926 and 1943, is one of the most beautiful and architecturally successful in the country. In addition to designing the campus, Saarinen served as the school's director, forming a school of architecture, art, and design which was for many years the nation's leading school of its type.²⁵ Cranbrook gave birth to an extraordinary group of men and women who largely shaped the direction of architecture, landscape architecture, interior design, and the arts in this country well into the 1980s. Among those who studied at Cranbrook or were associated with Saarinen's practice were Charles Eames (1907-1978) and Ray Eames, Florence Knoll, Eero Saarinen (1910-1961), Harry Weese (1915-1998), Alexander Girard (1907-1994) and many others.

The Saarinens and First Christian Church

Modernism was still in its youth in the United States when the congregation of the Tabernacle Christian Church in Columbus searched for an architect to design its new building in the late 1930s. After initial reluctance, Eliel Saarinen accepted the commission.²⁶ (After construction of the 1942 building, the name was changed to First Christian Church.) In the years leading up to this commission, Eliel and Eero had established a partnership as Saarinen and Saarinen, and had worked together on several projects, including the Cranbrook Institute of Science (1937), and Kleinhans Music Hall (Buffalo, 1938-40).

²⁵ Albert Christ-Janer, *Eliel Saarinen* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1948), pp.58-69.

²⁶ Elsie Irwin Sweeney, "Symbolism of the First Christian Church" (unpublished manuscript in collection of Cleo Rogers Memorial Library Architectural Archives).

Simultaneous with their work on First Christian, they were working on the Smithsonian Art Gallery (for which they had submitted the winning competition entry in 1939) and Crow Island School (1939-40), one of the most influential school designs of the twentieth century.²⁷ Also in this period, each pursued independent projects.

It is in First Christian Church that the independent work of Eliel and Eero are most happily joined. The building represents a synthesis of the approaches of the two architects: Eliel's focus on materials, craft, and relationship of the building to the user; and Eero's Modern aesthetic, demonstrated in his independent work for competitions such as the Wheaton College Art Center (1939), a project close to the norms of the International Style.²⁸ First Christian is a brilliant and subtly beautiful building. The interiors were designed by the architects, with fabrics and tapestry by Loja Saarinen, Eliel's wife. Charles Eames, who was at Cranbrook during this time, had significant input in the project, and is also credited as having prepared the renderings, and designed many of the furnishings.²⁹

The building's significance was immediately recognized in the architectural community, and was widely published in the mainstream architectural press, as well as in several publications on church architecture.

Reaction to the building in the community was mixed. Eliel had worked with a building committee, and had met with groups from the congregation. He prepared a booklet that explained his philosophy and gave answers to questions asked by the congregation. Because of this, the members of the church understood the architect's intention and embraced his design. Many others in the community were not convinced. The building did not look like a church to them, but rather like a factory or a warehouse. Over the next few years, however, the citizens of Columbus accepted Modern architecture as it began to impact their lives in a positive way.³⁰

The Beginnings of Columbus' Architectural Identity: the Work of Eero Saarinen, Harry Weese and Others in the 1950s and early 1960s

By the time of Eliel Saarinen's death in 1950, Eero had become a mature architect in his own right. During the 1950s, he designed some of the most significant buildings in the history of American architecture, construction completion of some occurring after his death in 1961 at the age of 51. Among the latter were the John Deere Administration Center in Moline, Illinois (1957), the Trans World Airlines Terminal Building at Kennedy Airport in New York (1962), and the Gateway Arch in St. Louis (1948-64).

Over the course of the decade, Eero designed three buildings in Columbus: Irwin Union Bank (1954), The Miller House (1957), and North Christian Church (1964). All three buildings have been highly praised by architectural critics and observers.

Irwin Union Bank was one of the first Modern bank buildings in the country. It is at first glance a Miesian glass pavilion, but as in much of Saarinen's work, the conceptual purity that characterized Mies' work is transformed. The flat concrete roof overhangs the glass wall by about four feet and is punctuated by a grid of shallow domes that house interior lights. The roof floats on round steel columns that are held well inside the window wall. Inside, the ground floor is a single space dominated by the roof plane and the indirectly lit domes.

²⁷ Albert Christ-Janer, *Eliel Saarinen* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1948), pp. 89-92.

²⁸ Russell Rudzinski, "Finnish-American Modernism: The First Christian Church by Eliel and Eero Saarinen 1942" (unpublished manuscript, December 1997).

²⁹ J. Irwin Miller, Interview with Louis Joyner and Laura Thayer, 8 June 1999.

³⁰ J. Irwin Miller, Interview with Louis Joyner and Laura Thayer, 8 June 1999.

In 1954, this was a revolutionary design for a bank building. Traditionally banks were imposing, intimidating Neo-classical structures. Tellers stayed behind bars, and many of the banking functions were concealed from the public. In Irwin Union, tellers were behind counters without bars, and other bank employees worked in clear view. The glass walls of the building, combined with Dan Kiley's landscape design of trees surrounding the structure, conveyed the impression of a transparent structure within a park setting.

One of a small number of residences designed by Saarinen, the Miller House, is located in Columbus. It is a one-story, flat-roofed building of luxurious materials that sits on a terrazzo podium within highly formal gardens designed by Dan Kiley. The interior designer was Alexander Girard. As in Irwin Union Bank, Saarinen drew on a Miesian Neoclassical model. A pristine example of the most academic aspects of Modern domestic design, the house is formal in character and the plan based on a nine-square symmetrical grid.³¹ Kiley's garden is a rare example of a large formal garden that has been maintained to maturity substantially as designed.

In 1959, Eero Saarinen began work on North Christian Church. This building, his last Columbus commission, was planned for a large, partially wooded site on the outskirts of town. The landscape design was by Dan Kiley, and liturgical furnishings were by Alexander Girard. The building is a six-sided, symmetrical structure with roof slopes that appear from a distance to meet the ground. A 192-foot spire dramatically rises from the center of the roof. The sanctuary is in the center and surrounded by a corridor that accesses rooms on the outside walls. Direct and indirect natural lighting, as well as artificial lighting, illuminate the building. Saarinen died before North Christian Church was completed. The building is considered to be one of his finest works.

The architect who has had the largest number of commissions in Columbus – at least 18 built projects – is Harry Weese (1915-1998). Weese had studied at MIT and Yale in the 1930s, and later at Cranbrook, where he was influenced by both Eliel and Eero Saarinen. After working for Skidmore, Owings and Merrill, and with Benjamin Baldwin, he formed Weese and Associates, which would become one of the leading architecture firms in Chicago. Nationally, Weese was best known for his design of the Washington D.C. Metro stations in the 1970s. Other notable works include the U.S. Embassy in Ghana (1958) and the Metropolitan Correction Center and Federal Courthouse Annex in Chicago (1975).

When Weese was hired for his first Columbus commission, it was still early in his career and he had little more than a few modest houses to his credit. Weese came into the picture when it was determined then that, as a result of rapid population growth, additional housing was necessary. A consultation with Eero Saarinen ultimately resulted in Weese being hired to design an apartment complex called Columbus Village (1951).³²

Columbus Village was a complex of several buildings of townhouse units. The complex was planned to meet the needs of young middle class families. The two-story apartment buildings face the interior streets of the complex. The living spaces in each unit are in the rear of the building, and open onto trellised patios that relate to a large common. Storage cabinets for each unit separate patios from one another giving private outdoor space to each unit.

Another Weese building, Lillian C. Schmitt Elementary School (1957), was the first school built under the auspices of the Cummins Engine Company program (Please see the Historic Context Statement "Patronage in Public Architecture"). Schmitt is based on a conventional school plan in which classrooms are arranged in a linear fashion along corridors. Schmitt varies from the rigidity of the typical pattern,

³¹ "A Contemporary Palladian Villa," *Architectural Forum* (September 1958).

³² J. Irwin Miller, Interview with Louis Joyner and Laura Thayer, 8 June 1999.

however. As in the Saarinen's Crow Island School, each classroom is treated as an independent, child-scaled space. Each classroom has a pitched roof, giving it its own identity, breaking down the mass of the building, and integrating the functional units with the structural system of pitched laminated wood beams and parallel masonry bearing walls. The school received a substantial addition in 1992, designed by Leers, Weinzapfel Associates of Boston. The original parts of the school were somewhat altered, but much of the historic fabric remains, and the architect's intent is still clearly evident.

Weese's buildings must have been appealing, as many people in Columbus turned to him in the early years of Modern architecture. The Hamilton Foundation, for example, commissioned Weese to design Lincoln Center, a public ice skating facility completed in 1958. The granite and wood building has a triple-peaked roof and centers on a circular granite fireplace. Hamilton-Cosco, the company with which the foundation is associated, hired Weese to design its new brick and glass Office Building (1962) on State Street. In 1951, a member of the Hamilton family employed Weese to design a lake cottage.

Harry Weese continued to be prolific in Columbus in the 1960s. Pleased with the results of Schmitt Elementary School, the school board again hired him for Northside Junior High School (1961). Northside is a two-story brick building, with closely spaced long, narrow segmental-arched windows that are reminiscent of nineteenth century industrial buildings. The building encloses a courtyard, an element that is seen elsewhere in Weese's work.

First Baptist Church (1965), built atop a small knoll in an otherwise flat landscape, is one of Weese's most admired Columbus buildings. The dominant features of the building are the steeply pitched roofs of the sanctuary and chapel, which rise from the low brick base of the building.

Other buildings in Columbus designed by Harry Weese included:

- The Boys and Girls Club (1954, demolished 1998), which made early use of exposed metal truss joists
- Hope Branch (1958) of Irwin Union Bank
- Bartholomew County Home (1959)
- Eastbrook Plaza Branch (1961) of Irwin Union Bank

Just as modern architecture was gaining a foothold in Columbus, through the buildings by Saarinen and Weese, it was gaining in popularity throughout the country. The ideas inherent in Modernist theory were compatible with the optimism and progressivism of the period. The forms and materials that Modernism advocated were suitable for a time when rapid population growth and economic expansion required many new buildings. Modern houses and furniture became more common. The accepted forms of Modernism proved to be capable of a refined sort of monumentality and implicit Classicism that appealed to corporate tastes. Well-known examples from this period were Skidmore, Owings and Merrill's Lever House in New York (1952), an early monument of corporate modernism, and Eero Saarinen's General Motors Technical Center in Warren, Michigan (1956), a large complex that applied the forms of Miesian Modernism to the scale of the automobile.

The demand for new buildings in the Columbus area continued in the early 1960s as the city grew and prospered. Churches, factories, recreational facilities, housing and public buildings were required. Schools continued to be one of the most pressing needs.

The school board had liked the results of its arrangement with Cummins Engine Foundation, and sought to continue it for the new schools that were planned. The foundation agreed to pay the architect's fee for any new school building if the board would select an architect from a list compiled by an independent panel. As a result of this agreement, the designers of Columbus area schools built in the early 1960s

included, in addition to Weese, such notable architects and firms as John Carl Warnecke, The Architects Collaborative, and Edward Larrabee Barnes.

In 1958, the school board selected John Carl Warnecke (1919-) to design the city's second foundation-supported school, Mabel McDowell Elementary School. Warnecke, whose father was a California architect, was brought up in the tradition of the Bay Area School developed by such architects as Bernard Maybeck (1862-1957) and William Wurster (1895-1973). Warnecke received a Bachelor of Architecture from Harvard in 1942. He practiced with his father before opening his own office in 1947. Among his early designs were several schools and college buildings on the West Coast. Warnecke's approach was based on function, but also emphasized harmony with the building's natural surroundings.

Warnecke achieved national recognition as an architect. Among his best-known commissions are the American Embassy in Thailand (1959), President John F. Kennedy's Gravesite (1966), and the Hawaii State Capitol (1969).

McDowell consists of one-story classroom units arranged in clusters of three around central gymnasium and cafeteria structures. The structures are brick and glass with low pyramidal roofs. The classrooms are linked to the common areas by trellised walkways. Five courtyards are formed by the arrangement of the structures and walkways. The building has been used since 1982 as an adult education center.

The next elementary school built in Columbus was Parkside (1962), the work of The Architect's Collaborative (TAC), with Norman Fletcher (1917-) as principal architect. Walter Gropius had founded TAC in 1945 with Fletcher and others. One of the most influential firms in the country during the 1950s, TAC produced many notable institutional and corporate buildings. For the design of Parkside, Fletcher utilized a series of barrel vaults that may be seen in the central multi-purpose section of the building and in the bus shelter in front of the building.

Community enthusiasm for good design generally increased with the completion of each new school. As a result, there were several private commissions by leading architects during these years, including Weese's office building for COSCO (1962), and his First Baptist Church (1965).

Building Boom: the late 1960s and 1970s

The buildings of the Saarinen, Weese, and a few others established the basis for Columbus' architectural identity. In the late 1960s, after the visit of Lady Bird Johnson, and after Cummins Engine Foundation expanded its patronage to all public buildings, the city began in earnest to embrace this identity.

As Columbus' collection of outstanding buildings grew, some observers characterized it as a microcosm of Modern American Architecture. In several cases such as First Christian Church, Fire Station No. 4 (Robert Venturi, 1967; see below), and Smith Elementary School (John Johansen, 1969; see below), the town's new buildings represented architectural innovation and risk-taking. Generally, Columbus' buildings have reflected the best in design and theory current at any given time in the leadership of the architectural profession. Because many of the buildings were designed with restrictive programs and limited budgets, the outstanding level of quality achieved in the city's architecture is a testament to the skill of the architects.

Robert Venturi's Fire Station No. 4 (1967) represented a sharp contrast to earlier designs in Columbus. The fire station is an unassuming, trapezoidal-shaped cinder block structure. Its principal façade is of red unglazed brick and white glazed brick. A 36-foot high hose-drying tower serves as a focal point for the simple building. Venturi explained his controversial design: "Where this little building looks ordinary, it summarizes its practical function and standard program. Where it is ornamented, it imposes a civic scale on the prosaic bulk and symbolizes a civic function in the vast space by the side of the road."

Venturi (1925-) received his architectural degree from Princeton, and worked with Eero Saarinen and Louis Kahn (1901-1974) before founding his own practice in 1958. Later, John Rauch and Venturi's wife Denise Scott-Brown joined the firm. Fire Station No. 4 was one of the early buildings of Venturi, who has been one of the most influential architects of his time. His theories have been largely responsible for the Post-Modern movement in architecture. Venturi was awarded the Pritzker Architecture Prize in 1991.

Lincoln Elementary School was built the same year as Fire Station No. 4. The architect for this latest educational building was Gunnar Birkerts (1925-) who had worked with Venturi for a time in the office of Eero Saarinen. Eero's influence can be seen in Birkert's work: in his search for a distinctive solution for each project, in his integration of structure and site, and in his use of exterior spaces as functional pieces in the design. Lincoln is located on a small urban site on Fifth Street. Birkerts designed the school as a square within a circle within a square. The central multi-purpose room is surrounded by a corridor with doorways that lead into classrooms. The low two-story brick building is surrounded by a wall that encloses the play area. Natural light enters through a skylight that extends around the building. The architect was the recipient of an American Institute of Architects honor award for this building in 1968.

The year after Lincoln, another building was completed that was of major importance on Fifth Street. This was Cleo Rogers Memorial Library (1969), designed by I.M. Pei (1917-). The library is a formal building of brick, with large openings that give it a monumental scale. Among features are an off-center, vestibuled main entrance and deeply recessed windows. The building occupies a site that was expanded with the closing of Lafayette Street between Fifth and Sixth streets, and with the demolition of several buildings. The large property made it possible for Pei to site the building some distance from Fifth Street, and develop a brick plaza in front. "Large Arch" (1971), a bronze sculpture designed by Henry Moore, occupies a prominent place on the southeast part of the plaza. The plaza draws in the open area in front of First Christian Church across the street to create an important urban space that is the location of festivals and concerts.

Born in China, Pei studied architecture at MIT and Harvard. After working for other firms for several years – Hugh Asher Stubbins in Boston, and Webb & Knapp in New York – Pei founded his own office in 1960. A student of Gropius, Pei is known for his large-scale geometric designs and use of materials such as stone, concrete, glass, and steel. Other works of the architect include the Rock and Roll Hall of Fame in Cleveland, and the Miho Museum in Shiga, Japan. Pei received the AIA Gold Medal in 1979 and the Pritzker Architecture Prize in 1983.

The library, a spacious, light-filled structure that replaced a cramped, dark Carnegie building, was well received by the community. The next two buildings were, however, accepted with some reservation. These were Southside Junior High School and L. Frances Smith Elementary School, both completed in 1969.

Southside, an example of the Brutalist subtype of Modern architecture, represented a radical approach in Columbus school architecture. The building was designed by Eliot Noyes (1910-1977). Noyes' buildings elsewhere in the nation include the prefabricated Bubble House in Hobe Sound, Florida (1954), Mobil Oil Corporation Research and Development Center in Princeton, New Jersey, and the IBM Building in Hamden, Connecticut (1971).

The period of the 1960s and 70s, as assessed by Arthur Drexler, was singularly concerned with handling buildings as sculptural forms.³³ When executed in concrete and steel, the buildings were considered Brutalist, such as the Yale School of Architecture (1963), designed by Paul Rudolph (1963). Brutalist

³³ Arthur Drexler, *Transformations in Modern Architecture* (New York: The Museum of Modern Art, 1979), p. 10.

buildings demonstrated the great sculptural and emotional power that architecture could convey. They were completely at odds with the spareness of Mies and the elegance of the classicists. Brutalism's rebellious quality was viewed during its period of popularity as a return to the spirit inherent in the original flowering of Modernism.³⁴ The style was utilized primarily in large, public buildings.

Southside exhibits many elements of Brutalism: a massive, sculptural, pre-cast concrete shell; large expanses of windowless walls; monumentality; lack of human scale; and a fortress-like exterior. Noyes' interior for the building includes a two-story central commons area under a skylight. Corridors for the four wings of the school access classrooms and feed into the Commons.

Though Southside is the only true local example of Brutalism, there are many buildings from the period that are based on an abstract sculptural form. The relationship of the building to the user is often cold and distant. I.M. Pei's Cleo Rogers Memorial Library and Roche's U.S. Post Office (1970; see below) are examples.

L. Frances Smith Elementary School (1969), designed by John Johansen (1916-), was another school that raised doubts in the minds of some members of the community. The building combined the best qualities of Brutalism, with the anxious energy of the late 1960s British group of architects known as Archigram. Although Smith was not as extreme as the fantasy buildings designed by Archigram, it utilized many of the same industrial elements. Smith consists of multi-level concrete classrooms connected by brightly colored steel tubes, which radiate from a central circulation core. The building was recognized as highly original by national observers when it was new. Local children immediately loved Smith, but a few of their parents took some time to accept a building that was such a departure from traditional school design.³⁵ A 1997 addition designed by Johansen's son Christian maintains the original concept.

John Johansen graduated in 1942 from the Harvard Graduate School of Design, where he studied under Walter Gropius and Marcel Breuer. He worked briefly for Breuer, the National Housing Agency in Washington, D.C., and Skidmore Owings and Merrill in New York before establishing his own office in 1948 in New Canaan, Connecticut.

His early work reflected the influence of the Bauhaus masters, but soon he began to search for new architectural ideas, leading him to become one of the most radical architects of the 1960s. Johansen became a leader for those seeking ways to revitalize building design through personal expressionism, as in his U.S. Embassy in Dublin (1964). Like his Mummer's Theater in Oklahoma City (1970), Smith Elementary School is a highly fragmented building connected by tunnels. It is aggressive in its expression of architectural ideas, borrowing elements of Brutalism in materials and detail.

The U.S. Post Office (1970), completed the year after Smith and Southside, was the first U.S. post office designed by privately funded architects. The building is composed of exposed rusted Cor-Ten structural steel members, and salt-glazed, dark brown structural clay tile. An arcade of massive pillars of this tile extends across the main façade of dark, mirrored glass.

The firm of Roche Dinkeloo and Associates designed the Post Office. Kevin Roche's education included study at University College in Dublin, and at the Illinois Institute of Technology under Mies van der Roche. Roche worked as Eero Saarinen's principal assistant for many years before Saarinen's death in 1961. He played a significant role in Saarinen's Columbus buildings, and other projects such as the St. Louis Arch, and the John Deere Headquarters. Upon Saarinen's death, Roche, with John Dinkeloo (1918-

³⁴ Robin Boyd, "The Sad End of New Brutalism," *Architectural Review* (July 1967).

³⁵ Bill Marvel, "A Quiet Town Becomes an Architectural Museum," *The National Observer* (6 September 1971).

1981), completed the many projects Saarinen had in progress, including North Christian Church. In the partnership, Roche was principal designer and Dinkeloo focused on construction and technology.

Roche and Dinkeloo proved themselves more than capable at undertaking the tasks, and in subsequent years built a practice that has produced some of the great monuments of corporate and institutional building in the country. Among them are the Ford Foundation Building, additions to the Metropolitan Museum of Art, General Mills, and Union Carbide. Honors bestowed upon Roche, including a Pritzker Architecture Prize (1982) and an AIA Gold Medal (1993), reflect his distinguished career.

In addition to the U.S. Post Office, Roche and Dinkeloo were responsible for other projects in the Columbus area in the 1970s. These included an addition to Irwin Union Bank (1973) and Cummins Midrange Engine Plant at Walesboro (1973).

The early 1970s produced a group of highly sculptural, glass-clad buildings, that represented a departure from the glass boxes of earlier years. One of these, built in 1973, was actually an addition for an earlier building, Roche and Dinkeloo's glass arcade for Irwin Union Bank. Also completed in 1973 were Cummins Occupational Health Association, designed by Hardy Holzman Pfeiffer Associates; and the Commons/Courthouse Center, designed by Cesar Pelli (1926-).

The partnership of Hardy Holzman Pfeiffer was established in New York in 1967. Cummins Occupational Health Association was an early commission for the firm, which would later be associated with a number of highly visible, cultural facilities like the Brooklyn Children's Museum and the Cooper-Hewitt Museum.

Pelli was an alumnus of Eero Saarinen's office. He was a partner with Gruen Associates in Los Angeles from 1968 to 1976. In 1977, he founded his own firm in New Haven, Connecticut. He served as Dean of the School of Architecture of Yale University from 1977 to 1984. Pelli's other works include the Pacific Design Center in Los Angeles (1975, with Gruen Associates), and the World Financial Center in New York (1981). Pelli was awarded the AIA Gold Medal in 1995.

Contemporary with the Cummins Occupational Health Association and the Commons/Courthouse Center was The Republic (1971), a re-emergence of the classic Miesian glass box. The recipient of an AIA Honor Award (1975), The Republic was designed by Myron Goldsmith (1918-1996) of the Chicago office of Skidmore Owings and Merrill (SOM). One of the nation's largest architectural firms with multiple offices, SOM was established in Chicago in 1936. The firm is known for large-scale projects such as the John Hancock Center and Sears Tower, both in Chicago, and for structural innovation.

Following the burst of building in the late 1960s and early 1970s, there was an interval during which few buildings were constructed. Between 1973 and 1981, only one edifice was added to Columbus' group of Modern structures: the Indiana Bell Switching Center (1978) designed by Paul Kennon of Caudill Rowlett Scott. This building, now the Ameritech Switching Center, was actually a remodeling and expansion of the existing Indiana Bell building. The building is clad in reflective glass, creating the effect of a "non-building" that mirrors surrounding historic structures. At the rear of the Switching Center are oversized, colorful "organ pipes," that conceal mechanical equipment. The building was the recipient of an AIA Honor Award in 1980.

Recent Trends in Columbus Architecture: the 1980s and 1990s

During the mid to late 1970s, when few buildings were being constructed in Columbus, a change took place in American architecture. There was a shift from the preoccupation with sculptural form that typified the 1960s and early 70s. Historicism was frequently seen in the 1980s and 90s, defining a classification known as "Post-Modern Classical." There was also greater attention to the relationships

between the user and the building and between the building and its urban setting than had typified the work of earlier decades.

City Hall (1981), a monumental structure that exhibited these qualities was the first new public building since Caudill Rowlett and Scott's Fodrea School (1973). City Hall was designed by Edward Charles Bassett (1921-1999) of Skidmore, Owings & Merrill's San Francisco office. The building has a triangular shaped plan with its longest side as the main façade, which is symmetrical. A semi-circular courtyard at the front of the building is reached by a grand stairway, and is framed by a modern variant of the baroque "broken pediment" composed of brick-clad steel cantilevers. Inside, the building was planned to be user-friendly, with governmental offices open to the two-story atrium at the front of the building.

Prior to planning the building itself, a feasibility study was conducted. One element of this study was determining the best location for a new city hall. The ultimate selection of a site diagonally across from the courthouse and across the street from the newspaper plant was practical as well as symbolic. The site was also ideal because of its location on the edge of downtown where it would not be necessary to demolish or displace any existing businesses.

Bassett received a Bachelor of Architecture degree from the University of Michigan in 1949 and a Master of Architecture degree from Cranbrook in 1951. He joined Skidmore Owings and Merrill in 1955 after working for Eero Saarinen for four years. Bassett was awarded the Arnold W. Brunner Prize in Architecture by the National Institute of Arts and Letters in 1963. He was also honored by being selected to design the U.S. Embassy in Moscow in the 1980s. After his recent death, Allan Temko, former architectural critic of the San Francisco Chronicle, called him "a leader in the efforts of modern architects to seek alternatives to the arid formulas of the International Style."³⁶

Another major project of the early 1980s was Cummins Engine Company Corporate Office Building (1983), designed by the veteran firm of Roche Dinkeloo and Associates. For this building, the architects restated the loggia of their earlier Post Office across Fifth Street. The open space on the large site was designed by Jack Curtis, Landscape Architect, to relate to the First Christian Church on Fifth Street. Another acknowledgement of existing conditions was the incorporation of the historic Ceraline Mill into the new design. The Cummins building is of white pre-cast concrete, and washed inside with light from numerous skylights. Although three blocks long, it is as light and elegant as the Post Office is dark and massive.

Roche Dinkeloo and Associates designs of the 1990s include an expansion of the Visitors Center (1995), and the expansion and renovation of the Cummins Main Engine Plant (1998). The many varied types of projects executed by Roche Dinkeloo and Associates in Columbus over the years illustrate the range and depth of the firm.

A contemporary of Roche and Dinkeloo, Gunnar Birkerts, returned to Columbus to design St. Peter's Lutheran Church, completed in 1988. Birkerts had designed Lincoln Elementary School over 20 years earlier, and was now challenged with the design of a church on a site across Fifth Street from the school. The result was a highly sculptural concrete and brick structure. The copper-clad steeple suggested an historic form. Tall windows between massive concrete walls provided natural light to a dramatic sanctuary. Open space in front of the church blended with open space in front of Lincoln School, enhancing the Fifth Street "civic corridor."

³⁶ Eric Pace, "Edward Bassett, Architect, Is Dead at 77," *The New York Times* (5 September 1999).

The three projects discussed above were all designed by veteran architects who worked with Eero Saarinen in the 1950s. Many of the buildings of the 1980s and 90s, however, have been designed by the next generation of Modern architects. Among the best known of these are Richard Meier (1934-), who designed Clifty Creek Elementary School; Charles Gwathmey (1938-), who designed two housing projects, Sycamore Place and Pence Place; and Robert A.M. Stern (1939-), who was responsible for a master plan for Columbus Regional Hospital, and designed an expansion for the facility.

Meier received his architectural degree from Cornell University in 1957. He worked with several firms, including Skidmore, Owings and Merrill, and Marcel Breuer, before establishing his own practice in 1963. Meier has developed a distinctive style of his own of white, sculptural forms. His commissions include The Atheneum in New Harmony, Indiana (1979), the Museum of Decorative Arts in Frankfurt, Germany (1984), and the Getty Center in Los Angeles (1997) He received the American Institute of Architects Gold Medal in 1997 and the Pritzker Architectural Prize in 1998.

Gwathmey studied at the University of Pennsylvania School of Architecture under Louis Kahn and Robert Venturi. In 1962, he received a Master in Architecture from Yale University, where he studied under Paul Rudolph and James Stirling. In 1971, he established a partnership with Robert Siegel. Gwathmey is known for combining vernacular types and nineteenth century materials with the simple, undecorated surfaces of Modern architecture. Major projects include the Guggenheim Museum Addition in New York (1985), and the Fogg Art Museum Extension at Harvard University (1991). Gwathmey was named a Fellow of the American Institute of Architecture in 1981.

Stern graduated from Yale in 1965. In his work, Stern employs architectural forms and details from the past, redefining them in Modern setting. His work fits comfortably into the vocabulary of Post-Modernism. Among Stern's major buildings are the Colgate Darden School of Business at the University of Virginia, Celebration Health in Celebration, Florida, and the recent Ohrstrom Library at St. Paul's School in Concord, New Hampshire. Stern was named a Fellow of the American Institute of Architects in 1984.

Two outstanding works of engineering, built in Columbus in the 1990s, are worthy of mention. Both designed by J. Muller International, these are the Columbus Gateway Arch Bridge (1998), and the Second Street Bridge (1999). The Gateway Arch Bridge is a 300-foot, single span structure that carries Interstate 65 over State Road 46. The north and south roadways are supported by transverse box girder floor beams, suspended by cable-stay hangers from steel basket-handle-arches. Since the bridge was completed, it has received several awards (see page 15 of "Patronage in Public Architecture" historic context statement). The Second Street Bridge is also a cable-stay bridge, with the loads carried by the transverse floor beams transferred to four pylons by the cable stays.

Buildings that are associated with the historic context "Modern Architecture and Landscape Architecture in Bartholomew County" and were built during the 1942-1965 period include:

First Christian Church (1942), 531 Fifth Street
Architect: Eliel Saarinen (1873-1950), Saarinen and Saarinen

Columbus Village (1951)
Architect: Harry Weese (1915-1998), Harry Weese and Associates

Irwin Union Bank (1954), 500 Washington Street
Architect: Eero Saarinen (1910-1961), Eero Saarinen and Associates, Architects

Miller House (1957)

Architect: Eero Saarinen (1910-1961), Eero Saarinen and Associates, Architects

Lillian C. Schmitt Elementary School (1957), 1057 27th Street

Architect: Harry Weese (1915-1998), Harry Weese and Associates

Lincoln Center (1958), 2501 25th Street

Architect: Harry Weese (1915-1998), Harry Weese and Associates

Bartholomew County Home (1959), 2525 Illinois Street

Architect: Harry Weese (1915-1998), Harry Weese and Associates

Mabel McDowell Elementary School (1960), 2700 McKinley Avenue

Architect: John Carl Warnecke (1919-)

Northside Junior High School (1961), 2700 Maple Street

(Northside Middle School)

Architect: Harry Weese (1915-1998), Harry Weese and Associates

Hamilton Cosco Office Building (1962) 2525 State Street

Architect: Harry Weese (1915-1998), Harry Weese and Associates

Parkside Elementary School (1962) 1400 Parkside Drive

Architect: Norman Fletcher (1917-), The Architects Collaborative

Bartholomew County School Corporation Administration Building (1963), 2650 Home Avenue

Architect: Norman Fletcher (1917-), The Architects Collaborative

North Christian Church (1964), 850 Tipton Lane

Architect: Eero Saarinen (1910-1961), Eero Saarinen and Associates, Architects

Otter Creek Golf Course and Clubhouse (1964), 11522 East 50 North

Architect: Harry Weese (1915-1998), Harry Weese and Associates

Landscape Architect: Dan Kiley (1912-)

Golf Course Designer: Robert Trent Jones

First Baptist Church (1965), 3300 Fairlawn Drive

Architect: Harry Weese (1915-1998), Harry Weese and Associates

W.D. Richards Elementary School (1965), 3311 Fairlawn Drive

Architect: Edward Larrabee Barnes (1915-)

Other resources associated with the context but built after 1965 include:

Foundation for Youth (1966), 400 N. Cherry Street

Architect: Fisher & Spillman

Fire Station No. 4 (1967), 4730 25th Street

Architect: Robert Venturi (1925-), Venturi & Rauch

Four Seasons Retirement Center (1967), 1901 Taylor Road

Architect: Norman Fletcher (1917-), The Architects Collaborative

Lincoln Elementary School (1967), 750 5th Street
Architect: Gunnar Birkerts (1925-)

Cummins Engine Company Technical Center (1968), 1900 McKinley Avenue
Architect: Harry Weese (1915-1998), Harry Weese and Associates

Cleo Rogers Memorial Library (1969), 536 5th Street
Architect: I.M. Pei (1917-), I.M. Pei and Partners

L. Frances Smith Elementary School (1969), 4505 Waycross Drive
Architect: John M. Johansen (1916-)

Southside Junior High School (1969), 1320 West Road 200 South
(Southside Elementary School)
Architect: Eliot Noyes (1910-1977)

Columbus Post Office (1970), 450 Jackson Street
Architect: Kevin Roche (1922-), Roche Dinkeloo & Associates

Cummins Engine Company Warehouse (c.1970), 983 South Marr Road
Architect: Bruce Adams

The Republic (1971), 333 2nd Street
Architect: Myron Goldsmith (1918-1996), Skidmore, Owings & Merrill

Columbus East High School (1972), 230 South Marr Road
Architect: Romaldo Giurgola (1920-), Mitchell-Guirgola

Mt. Healthy Elementary School (1972), 12150 South SR 58
Architect: Hugh Hardy (1932-), Hardy Holzman Pfeiffer Associates

Par 3 Golf Course Clubhouse (1972), Fairlawn at Par 3 Drive
Architect: Bruce Adams

Quinco Consulting Center (1972), 2975 Lincoln Park Drive
(Columbus Regional Hospital Mental Health Center)
Architect: James Stewart Polshek (1930-), James Stewart Polshek & Partners

Cummins Occupational Health Association (1973), 605 Cottage Avenue
Architect: Hardy Holzman Pfeiffer

Cummins Midrange Engine Plant (1973), 450 South SR 58, Walesboro
Architect: Kevin Roche (1922-), Roche Dinkeloo & Associates

Fodrea Community School (1973), 2775 Illinois Street
Architect: Paul Kennon (1934-1990), Caudill Rowlett Scott

Commons/Courthouse Center (1973), 4th & Washington Streets
Architect: Cesar Pelli (1926-), Gruen Associates

Indiana Bell Telephone Company Switching Center (1978), 7th & Franklin Streets

Architect: Paul Kennon (1934-1990), Caudill Rowlett & Scott

Columbus City Hall (1981), 123 Washington Street

Architect: Edward Charles Bassett (1921-1999), Skidmore Owings & Merrill

CERAland Recreation Center (1982), 3989 South 525 East

Architect: Roth & Moore Architects

Clifty Creek Elementary School (1982), 4625 East 5th Street

Architect: Richard Meier (1934-), Richard Meier & Partners

Sycamore Place (1982), 222 Sycamore Place

Architect: Charles Gwathmey (1938-), Gwathmey Siegel & Associates

Cummins Engine Company Corporate Office Building (1983), 500 Jackson Street

Architect: Kevin Roche (1922-), Roche Dinkeloo & Associates

Pence Place Apartments (1984), Pence Street

Architect: Charles Gwathmey (1938-), Gwathmey Siegel & Associates Architects

Fire Station No. 5 (1987), 100 Goeller Court

Architect: Susana Torre (1944-), Wank Adams Slavin Associates

St. Peter's Lutheran Church (1988), 719 5th Street

Architect: Gunnar Birkerts (1925-), Gunnar Birkerts & Associates

Hope Elementary School (1989), SR 9, Hope

Architect: Taft Architects

Bartholomew County Jail (1990), 350 2nd Street

Architect: Don Hisaka, Don M. Hisaka & Associates

Mill Race Park (1992), 50 5th Street

Landscape Architect: Michael Van Valkenburgh

Architect: Stanley Saitowitz

Columbus Regional Hospital (1992), 2400 East 17th Street

Architect: Robert A.M. Stern (1939-), Robert A.M. Stern Architects with Falik, Klein Partnership

Breeden Building (1995), 700 Washington Street

Architect: Thomas Beeby (1941-), Hammond Beeby and Babka

The Republic Printing Center (1997), 3330 West International Court

Architect: GSI Architects Inc

Columbus Gateway Arch Bridge (1998), I-65 and SR 46

Designer: J. Muller International

Fire Station No. 6 (1998), SR 58 & I-65

Architect: William Rawn, William Rawn & Associates

Cummins Engine Plant (1998), Central Avenue
Architect: Kevin Roche (1922-), Roche, Dinkeloo & Associates

Hope Library (1998), 638 Main Street, Hope
Architect: Deborah Berke (1944-), Deborah Berke & Associates

Foundation for Youth (1998), 400 N. Cherry Street
Architect: Michael Shirley, Hellmuth, Obata + Kassabaum

Bridge (1999), 2nd Street over East Fork White River
Designer: J. Muller International

Artwork and Furnishings

A principle of Modern architecture that has been expressed in Columbus buildings is total design integration, including artwork and furnishings. The desire for this comprehensive approach was indicated in guidelines distributed by Cummins Engine Foundation for its architecture program:

“The architect selected must have the responsibility for planning and designing the total building. This includes recommending landscaping and designing outside areas. In addition, he or she is responsible for locating the building on the site, selecting all colors and recommending all furnishings to be used.”³⁷

In some cases, furniture has been designed specifically for the building. For example, Charles Eames designed furniture for First Christian Church. Furniture in Irwin Union Bank was designed by the building’s architect, Eero Saarinen. In both cases, this original furniture is still in use.

Artwork has often been commissioned for a particular project. “The Sermon on the Mount” in First Christian Church was designed by the architect, Eliel Saarinen. Stairway murals in Southside Junior High School were the work of Ivan Chermayeff. Paintings commissioned for City Hall were done by artists Robert Indiana and William T. Wiley.

Many outstanding examples of sculpture are associated with Columbus properties. The first of these was “The Family,” designed by Harris Barron for the central courtyard of Parkside Elementary School. Others include Henry Moore’s “Large Arch” (1971) sculpted for the Cleo Rogers Memorial Library Plaza, Rick Bauer’s “Skopos” (c.1980) in Mill Race Park, and Cork Marcheschi’s neon sculpture in a recently revitalized downtown alley. Indoor sculptures include Jean Tinguely’s “Chaos I” (1974) in The Commons, Rudolph de Harak’s “Exploded Engine” in Cummins Engine Company Corporate Office Building, and Dale Chihuly’s “Yellow Neon Chandelier” (1995) in the Visitors Center. “Horses,” a sculptural group by Constantino Nivola, formerly on the lawn of Richards Elementary School, has been removed.

Overview of Modernism in Landscape Architecture

The history of landscape architecture as a profession in America begins with Central Park, New York, begun in 1857 and completed in 1863.³⁸ Before this project, no large open spaces, state, or national parks were established. After the success of Central Park, the demand for parks created a new profession called landscape architecture. The profession of Landscape Architecture flourished in the United States from 1900-1930. This period of Landscape Architecture is perhaps best known for the flowering of the “country place.” The design of grand and extravagant residential landscapes and gardens was fueled by

³⁷ Cummins Engine Foundation, Architecture Program, Information Sheet, November 1984

³⁸ Fabos, et al, Frederick Law Olmsted, Sr., Founder of Landscape Architecture in America, Univ. of Mass. Press, 1968

the prosperity of the “Jazz Age.” Elaborate formal gardens, wild gardens, terraces, allées, bowling greens, and fountains set into vast private parks were designed for the nation’s wealthy. Most landscape architects exploited multiple formal approaches to design including bi-lateral symmetry, central axes, ordered vistas and classical detailing, as well as the “natural style” promoted by Jens Jensen.

In this same period, some of the most significant landscape architecture was for national and state parks. Park systems were expanded and modernized to accommodate an increasingly motorized public while preserving scenic and historic places. “Park village” site plans and “rustic” architectural styles allowed park roads, buildings, and other facilities to harmonize with the composed landscape. Other landscape architects concentrated on town planning and the design of new towns that featured centralized civic spaces, hierarchies of street and path types, and distorted grids of streets that responded to topography, range of housing types, and land uses. The automobile began to influence almost all aspects of landscape architecture. Landscape Architects designed regional recreational areas and parks, and in collaboration with engineers designed new parkways and parkway systems.³⁹

The economic stagnation of the Great Depression in the early 1930s ended the “county place” practice of landscape architecture. However, the New Deal launched by President Roosevelt in 1933 made a wide range of public work funds available. Most landscape architects became employed through the New Deal, and shaped essential aspects of many recreation and conservation programs, designed parks, developed new towns, completed regional plans and preserved historic sites and buildings.

Other important changes were underway in the profession. In 1937 an exhibition, “Contemporary Landscape Architecture and Its Sources,” was held at the San Francisco Museum of Art. The show examined modernist influences on landscape design and postulated a theory of modern gardening. Henry-Russell Hitchcock, Jr., co-curator of the show, stated that “landscape planning should seek to preserve all the values of a natural environment and therefore should mainly be concerned with neither design or planting, but choice of site.”⁴⁰ Hitchcock also felt landscape architecture was not a separate art at all, but a sort of outdoor architecture, that should be in keeping with the formal character of recent trends in Modernist architecture.⁴¹

Modern landscape architecture came into its own in the 1930s and 40s. When Christopher Tunnard immigrated to the United States to teach at Harvard University, he influenced a number of young American students who would later contribute to a transcontinental movement in landscape design. Garrett Eckbo wrote: “The atmosphere of the Graduate School of Design was charged, controversial and exciting. Of the twenty students in landscape architecture, three – Dan Kiley, Jim Rose and I – were so turned on by the new ideas upstairs (referring to the architecture school and Walter Gropius) – that on our own we began to explore new forms and arrangements which might reflect the new design ideas.”⁴² At the same time, influenced by Japanese gardens and abstract art, Bay Area landscape architects such as Thomas Church, Lawrence Halprin, and others, created landscapes that incorporated asymmetrical geometries, flowing spaces, coordinated indoor and outdoor activities and used plants as sculptural elements. The garden was depicted as “space sculpture to be experienced,” its forms generated by people’s activities instead of style.⁴³ The results of these two parallel efforts became the modern design approach that has dominated American landscape architecture through the middle third of the century. It

³⁹ Ethan Carr, “Timeline,” *Landscape Architecture* (January, February, and March 1999).

⁴⁰ Henry-Russell Hitchcock, Jr., *Contemporary Landscape Architecture and Its Sources* (San Francisco Museum of Art, 1937).

⁴¹ Ethan Carr, *Landscape Architecture* (April 1999).

⁴² Peter Frampton, “In Search of the Modern Landscape,” *Denatured Visions: Landscape and Culture in the Twentieth Century*, Edited by Stuart Wrede and William Howard Adams (New York: Museum of Modern Art, 1994.)

⁴³ Jory Johnson, “Timeline,” *Landscape Architecture* (June 1999).

made it possible to eliminate preconceived design vocabularies, and to develop forms and arrangements that spoke to specific sites, clients, users, local contexts and regional cultures.⁴⁴

Through the 1950s, Modernism in landscape architecture reigned. The Connecticut General Life Insurance site with courtyards by Isamu Noguchi, the Miller Garden by Dan Kiley and the MOMA Sculpture Garden by Phillip Johnson, made Modernism the landscape architectural style *du jour* for corporate America.⁴⁵

At least four distinct Modernist modes may be identified. The first was the body of landscape design associated with Frank Lloyd Wright in the 1950s. Wright used modern engineering and materials to meld building and nature. The second was Eero Saarinen's association with powerful landscape design collaborators, including Dan Kiley, Hideo Sasaki and Thomas Church. Their work with Saarinen epitomized a second, distinct Modernism, the minimalist corporate campus dominated by landscape and outdoor sculpture. Saarinen wrote that the sites were "of course, designed at automobile scale, and the changing vistas were conceived to be seen as one drove around the project." The third variant on Modernism in Landscape Architecture was the melding of function with lush artscape. Modern art's geometric abstraction defined a path between the traditional poles of formal and natural to create livable landscapes. The fourth mode of Modernism was the shunning of personality and style to solve community problems. Public works and social housing schemes remained unglamorous, and they often did not seem particularly modern. The Westchester Parkway, New York's Jones Beach, Chatham Village, and the Blue Ridge Parkway were representative of the unglamorous public works and social housing schemes that were another Modernist sensibility in landscape architecture.⁴⁶

Other landscape architects such as McHarg, Sasaki, and Halprin were exploring the social and political issues in regions and cities, especially in the areas of systematic ecological and environmental analysis. Landscape architects traveling to Europe were enamored by the modern design of compact urban communities, boulevarded streets, adventure playgrounds, and public art that raised the standards of value in daily living.⁴⁷

In the 1960s the celebration of the California garden and modern design gave way to rational planning. Whole new towns, designed from scratch to be in harmony with existing features, incorporated clustered, identifiable villages instead of sprawl. Ecological design was promoted. A new vision of urban public space was developed by creative design based on behavioral observation and research, exemplified by Paley Park (Robert Zion) and the Riis Housing project (Paul Friedberg).⁴⁸

Today, the impulses that inspired Modernism in landscape architecture retain their power. In a period that is a post-estate (easy-care era) as much as post-modern, the search for simplicity is implicit. Modernism in landscape architecture brought today's contemporary considerations to the fore: inserting structure into the layout of spaces and treating plant materials as three-dimensional shapes.⁴⁹

Landscape Architecture in Columbus

There are few significant designed landscapes of any style built in Columbus before 1942. One noteworthy exception however is the 1910 garden associated with the Irwin Home on Fifth Street. Its

⁴⁴ Peter Frampton, "In Search of the Modern Landscape," *Denatured Visions: Landscape and Culture in the Twentieth Century*, Edited by Stuart Wrede and William Howard Adams (New York: Museum of Modern Art, 1994).

⁴⁵ Jory Johnson, "Timeline," *Landscape Architecture* (June 1999).

⁴⁶ Robert L. Miller, "No Style At All?" *Landscape Architecture* (January 1990).

⁴⁷ Jory Johnson, "Timeline," *Landscape Architecture* (June 1999).

⁴⁸ Jory Johnson, "Timeline," *Landscape Architecture* (June 1999).

⁴⁹ Jane Holtz Kay, "Modernism: The Invisible Guest," *Landscape Architecture* (January 1990).

design, based on the garden of Casa degli Inamorati in Pompeii, was the work of Henry Phillips. The garden is a richly furnished and detailed formal Beaux Arts composition married seamlessly to the Italianate mansion. The garden and house form the east edge of the library plaza and are a foil to the abstract modernist forms of that space, as well as to the similarly Modernist forms of the Birkerts' designed Lincoln Elementary School further east on Fifth Street.

The development of Modern landscape architecture in Columbus was originally associated with individual building projects, with most architects viewing their projects to include site development as an extension and expression of the primary architecture. In the first instance of Modern architecture in Columbus, Eliel Saarinen designed the site at First Christian Church as an extension of his architectural vision, defining exterior space through articulation of building elements, such as the use of the lower courtyard's parapet wall, to integrate the building into the landscape and townscape. The lawns, overlaid with a grid of walkways and canopy street trees that stem from the building's plan proportions, create a park like setting between the dense downtown fabric and the adjoining residential sector.

Subsequent architects engaged landscape architects as their sub-consultants to assist with the implementation of their vision. Dan Kiley collaborated with many architects on landscape architectural projects in Columbus. The first of these was the Miller House designed by Eero Saarinen. The Miller Garden and "its status as an icon of Modernism in American landscape architecture" are the result of a fusion of ideas that cross boundaries between architecture and landscape.⁵⁰ For Kiley the search for a Modern landscape was a spatial search: a drive to find space that did not depend on accepted pictorial conventions, or an old world reliance on strict or complete enclosure and separation, or the replication of time-honored patterns and shapes, or the imitation of naturally occurring plant communities. He pursued this search through a medium that was traditional, but he found ways to make it dynamic and timeless.⁵¹

Dan Kiley wrote that "the opportunity to travel around Western Europe . . . and to experience formal, spatial built landscapes . . . this was what I had been searching for – a language with which to vocalize the dynamic hand of human order on the land – a way to reveal nature's power and create spaces of structural integrity. I suddenly saw that lines, allées and orchards/bosques of trees and clipped hedges, canals, pools and fountains could be tools to build landscapes of clarity and infinity . . ."⁵² Several projects from the late 1940s and early 1950s showed signs that a synthesis of strong classical language with spatial play was forming as Kiley's design idiom. With the Miller Garden in Columbus, Kiley developed a series of outdoor rooms that unfold and open to join with one another. He utilized the same geometry as Saarinen had created for the house, and made a series of green rooms using trees in groves and allées layered to extend outward. The Hamilton Garden (1959) was a continuation of Kiley's exploration of geometrically related spatial volumes for another private residence in Columbus.⁵³

The North Christian Church site, designed by Kiley in 1964, is an excellent example of the creation of a sequential landscape, with ordered rooms, sensitive to the surrounding neighborhood context. Oriented to the needs of the automobile, the design accommodates the automobile without intruding into the pastoral landscape setting. The landscape design creates a base plane on which the church is sited, allowing the church form to grow out of the site, ascending to the sky. The North Christian Church site and landscape

⁵⁰ Gary R. Hilderbrand, *The Miller Garden: Icon of Modernism* (Washington, D.C.: Spacemaker Press, 1999), pg. 23.

⁵¹ Gary R. Hilderbrand, *The Miller Garden: Icon of Modernism* (Washington, D.C.: Spacemaker Press, 1999), pg. 24.

⁵² Dan Kiley and Jane Amidon, *Dan Kiley: The Complete Works of America's Master Landscape Architect* (Boston: Bulfinch Press, 1999), pg. 13.

⁵³ Dan Kiley and Jane Amidon, *Dan Kiley: The Complete Works of America's Master Landscape Architect* (Boston: Bulfinch Press, 1999), pg. 205

have recently been recognized as of historic merit with the receipt of the 1999 American Society of Landscape Architects (ASLA) Centennial Medallion Award. The medallion award represents landscapes as deemed nationally significant by the ASLA.

Kiley affected the spatial ordering of Columbus and the design sensibilities of its citizens towards landscape architecture. When the community planned thoroughfare improvements for Haw Creek Boulevard in association with the Cummins Technical Center (1968), Kiley designed an allée of London plane trees that celebrated the sweep of Haw Creek while creating a buffer to the depressed parking lot room associated with the Cummins Engine Plant. When Columbus planned a bicentennial celebration for 1976, Kiley was commissioned to develop a landscape plan for the connection between the interstate and the downtown core. The resulting willow planting, begun as little more than whips, created a geometric allée across an agricultural floodplain that quickly matured to form a dramatic though short-lived entry corridor edge. Perfectly scaled to the length of the route, it signaled unmistakably to the arriving motorist that a special place lay ahead.⁵⁴

Other landscape architectural practice was occurring in Columbus in the form of urban design in the 1960s. Columbus had been laid out on a grid in the early nineteenth century. The original plat was landlocked by rivers to the west and south. The north/south Washington Street was historically and is today the city's main street. The Courthouse was located near the south end; the 1912 U.S. Post Office roughly defined the north end of the commercial district. Fifth Street, roughly mid-point along this stretch, was an important side street, with a concentration of civic and cultural institutions, including a theater, the 1895 City Hall, the Carnegie Library, and two churches. As was the case in many cities in the 1960s, though, the once vital downtown was in decline. City leaders, with foundation support, looked to leading urban planners and landscape architects for solutions.

The "Columbus, Indiana Central Area Plan" was completed in 1968 by Skidmore, Owings, and Merrill (SOM) in association with Sasaki, Dawson, DeMay Associates and Barton-Aschman Associates, Inc. Sasaki, Dawson, DeMay Associates, the landscape architectural sub-consultant to SOM, was breaking new ground in the landscape architectural community, although in a different way than Dan Kiley. Process-oriented planning, which considered zoning, local attitudes, and physical capacity for the land was being pioneered by Sasaki. The resulting downtown plan for Columbus proposed the building of additional civic buildings, including the Post Office, the Commons Mall, and City Hall. In addition it proposed open space and transportation improvements including a new entrance bridge to the downtown, a streetscape for Washington Street (the city's main street) an improved Mill Race Park and the reorganization of the street systems. Many of these recommendations were ultimately implemented with the assistance of the Cummins Engine Foundation, and ended up contributing to the collection of Modernist design forms in the community.

During the 1960s and 1970s, many of the buildings and their associated sites were constructed. Dan Kiley designed the landscape and site for most of the school projects, some parks and recreation facilities, many of the Cummins Engine Company projects, projects for other corporate clients in Columbus, and private residences. This body of work has survived the ravages that neglect or uninformed maintenance over time often inflict on designed landscapes. The works themselves maintain the essential genius of the designed place.⁵⁵ The combination of attentive care of valued works as they mature, and their frequency within a concise geographic area has created a critical mass of intentional landscapes that are beginning to define the larger environment.

⁵⁴ Meg Storrow and John Kinsella, "The Leveraging of Infrastructure Renewal to Create an Interstate Front Door," *1997 Annual Meeting Proceedings*, Edited by Cheryl Wagner (Washington, D.C.: American Society of Landscape Architects, 1997).

⁵⁵ Jane Brown Gillette, "Kiley Revisted," *Landscape Architecture* (August 1998).

The master development plan for Tipton Lakes, a planned residential community, was accomplished by Phil Franks, architect and planner, of Kise, Franks and Straw Inc. of Philadelphia in the 1970s. Over 1,200 acres, the development includes three lakes, canals, marina, boulevards, and a continuous pedestrian path system. When fully developed, Tipton Lakes is planned to have over 2,000 residential units in varying price ranges and styles. The development company is an offshoot of Irwin Management Company, managed by the Miller family. The company established the standard for residential development in Columbus, and raised the threshold of landplanning throughout the community. Tipton Lakes has been noted nationally as one of the best residential and recreational communities in America.⁵⁶

In 1982-1983 the City of Columbus and the Irwin-Sweeney-Miller Foundation, with additional support from the National Endowment for the Arts, jointly sponsored a Carscape Design Competition. The widespread interest in the problem of the parking lot in urban areas resulted in the submission of 130 entries. A book was written and an exhibition prepared of the entries that best demonstrated the innovative approaches generated by the competition to parking lot design. A goal of the competition was to seek innovative solutions to the problem of designing the space needed for cars so that the space would be integrated into and would enhance the urban environment.⁵⁷ All of the entries proved to be too expensive to construct, so the parking lot was ultimately designed by city staff. C. Edward Curtin, the city landscape architect, designed it as room bordered by trees and a dense mix of perennials and shrubs that were chosen to provide interest through the seasons. A clearly structured pedestrian connection to and through a former alley links to the main street. While the more assertive designs of Carscape proved not feasible to construct, the realized project achieves an environmental quality and experience usually more mundanely expressed for such land uses.

Landscape architect Jack Curtis started working in Columbus, Indiana in the early 1980s. He was a partner with The LandPlan Partnership of Southport, Connecticut. After its dissolution in 1983, he established a new firm, Jack Curtis & Associates, located in Monroe, Connecticut.

Jack Curtis started working with Kevin Roche John Dinkeloo and Associates (KRJD) in the early 1980s in the East Coast region. The association with KRJD is what brought Curtis to the attention of Columbus. Roche asked Curtis to provide landscape architectural services for the Cummins Engine Corporate Office Building. Curtis' firm designed a harmonious ensemble of natural and man-made features that incorporated a traditional streetscape around the perimeter of the site. This was a departure from the Kiley idiom of bosques and allees. In Curtis's case however, the style is informal and naturalized. This informal arrangement allowed the spatial design of the space to remain intact if one or more of the specimen plant materials died or became disfigured. He stated that "the intent of the design concept was to incorporate a streetside public open space that would intensify one's perception of light, color, texture, sound and space as they highlight time through the seasons."⁵⁸ In 1991, Jack Curtis & Associates received an honor award for design by the Indiana Chapter American Society of Landscape Architects.

Curtis continues to participate in other Columbus projects, including renovations to the Miller Garden, historic Irwin Gardens, and Cummins Engine facilities. He has also collaborated in the master plan process for facility expansion for several Cummins Engine projects, including the Technical Center, Engine Plant, and Walesboro Plant. One of Curtis's strengths is that he is sensitive when renovating landscapes designed by others, and respects their design idiom. In 1998 Curtis prepared a Streetscape Master Plan that proposed two-way traffic for Washington Street (at that time it was one way going

⁵⁶ Lester J. Giese, et al, *The 99 best Residential and Recreational Communities in America* (1991).

⁵⁷ Catherine G. Miller, *Carscape: A Parking Handbook* (Washington Street Press, 1988), pg. 37.

⁵⁸ Indiana Chapter American of Landscape Architects, "Significant Works in Landscape Architecture in Indiana," (1991).

south), pedestrian improvements and street furnishings. The Curtis plan was never implemented, but was the springboard for future improvements.

In 1998 the Parks and Recreation Department, with funding assistance from the Cummins Engine Foundation, commissioned Storrow Kinsella Partnership, a Columbus-based landscape architectural firm, to analyze the once powerful but declining willow corridor that Dan Kiley had designed twenty years earlier for State Road 46 between the interstate and downtown. The study evolved to an overall entryway planning exercise titled the Jonathan Moore Pike Study which proposed implementation of a comprehensive entryway through the leveraging of predictable infrastructure renewal projects.⁵⁹ A pedestrian/bicycle system, a thread of landscape continuity, and siting of a new bridge as a diagonal approach to the downtown courthouse were key elements of the plan. A subsequent 1991 strategic plan for the Columbus Downtown and its Interstate approach by architect Paul Kennon of CRSS titled "Some Community Ideas" embraced the design principles of the Jonathan Moore Pike Study, promoted renovation and expansion of Mill Race Park, encouraged proceeding with streetscape improvements for Washington Street. These three focus areas were presented as a set of integrated and connected urban design projects.⁶⁰

These recommendations, developed in a community participatory process pioneered by CRSS, galvanized the community, and exciting works of Modern architecture, landscape architecture and engineering were generated. The first of these was the Washington Street streetscape. Kennon, in association with Michael Van Valkenburgh, adopted the major tenets of the Curtis Streetscape Plan. One-way Washington Street was changed to two-way vehicular traffic, with flowering pear trees, patterned brick sidewalks, and intersection plaza nodes of unit pavers in a circle-within-square geometry. Important resultants of the project were creation of a visible greenspace thread linking many of the architectural masterpieces, and strengthening of downtown's image as the cultural and civic heart of the community.

In addition, urban design improvements have been made to Fifth Street. Washington and Fifth Streets are the primary, or alpha streets, of the downtown. Washington Street is the commercial and governmental axis. Fifth Street bisects it with a cross-town connection between east side industry, residential neighborhoods, the downtown core, and the city's major open space and festival grounds. The eastern end of Fifth Street terminates in the entrance to the Cummins Main Engine Plant, with its allée of ginkgo trees. The western end of Fifth Street terminates with Mill Race Park on axis with an observation tower. A landscaped median and specially fabricated arching red-painted steel streetlights strengthen this connection.

The second recommendation Kennon made in "Some Community Ideas" was to renovate Mill Race Park. Kennon adopted recommendations prepared by Curtin, the city's landscape architect, as the goals for the project. Michael Van Valkenburgh Associates, of Cambridge, Massachusetts, was selected by the Parks and Recreation Department to transform Mill Race Park, completed in 1993. The Cummins Engine Foundation paid for design fees, and the park was largely built with donated funds from private citizens, local industry and other local foundations. According to Van Valkenburgh, the intent was to "create a small town equivalent of New York City's Central Park."⁶¹ One of the basic ideas underlying Van Valkenburgh's creative philosophy was to create context, including the immediate physical surroundings, as well as historical, cultural and social factors. "The project has been considered a major example of deconstructivism in landscape architecture by some critics (such as Eve M. Kahn in the *Wall Street*

⁵⁹ Meg Storrow and John Kinsella, "The Leveraging of Infrastructure Renewal to Create an Interstate Front Door," *1997 Annual Meeting Proceedings*, Edited by Cheryl Wagner (Washington, D.C.: American Society of Landscape Architects, 1997), pg. 18.

⁶⁰ "Columbus Indiana: Some Community Ideas," (CRSS, Inc., 1991), pg. 12.

⁶¹ "Mill Race Park," *Architectural Record* (November 1993), pg. 115.

Journal) but does concede particular importance to functional and psychological aspects and to the traditional components of landscape architecture, such as climate, vegetation, water, and the transforming action of time.”⁶² Van Valkenburgh collaborated with the San Francisco architect Stanley Saitowitz, who designed the park structures. It is said that Van Valkenburgh Associates and architect Stanley Saitowitz have created one of the most attractive projects in contemporary landscape design. The combination of cultural symbolism, public service, and natural features led to a fascinating and unusual design solution.⁶³

Mill Race Park is located “at the meeting of city and river”, as Michael Van Valkenburgh describes it. The park’s built forms and landscapes range from urban to wild, and its uses from communal to solitary.⁶⁴ Along the park’s urban edge, the landscape and hardscape tend to be rectilinear: parking lots framed by remnants of old concrete floodwalls, rows of Kentucky coffee and hackberry trees, and an 80-foot observation tower, axially sited in line with Fifth Street and the downtown. The urban edge gives way to softer forms, terminating in natural vegetation along the meandering riverbank, which borders the park on three sides. The park includes two lakes, the formal 450-foot diameter Round Lake and the previously existing informal North Lake. Interspersed throughout the park are a series of red-painted structures designed by architect Stanley Saitowitz, including an amphitheater stage, arbor, picnic shelters, fishing piers, boathouse, and rest rooms. Park facilities also include an existing covered bridge, a playground, basketball court, horseshoe pit, wetlands interpretive area with raised boardwalk, wildflower area, and a Riverwalk that connects to the city’s path system outside the park borders. Mill Race Park received the 1994 American Society of Landscape Architects Design Merit Award.

Van Valkenburgh has worked on a series of subsequent commissions in Columbus, including landscape design for the Central Fire Station, the Bartholomew County Jail, and the Veterans Memorial adjacent to the Courthouse. In addition, he assisted Paul Kennon in the design of the Washington Street streetscape. Van Valkenburgh represents the contemporary landscape architect. He stated, “The only way for landscape architecture to survive is for the ecological concerns of one camp of the profession and the design genius of another part of the profession to merge, and that’s what we’ve been trying to do in my office.”⁶⁵

The third recommendation of the Kennon Plan was to implement the Front Door project, the link between the interstate and downtown. Eventually the community leveraged the design concepts through a demonstration highway project, receiving specially designated funds from the U.S. Congress. The Front Door project is a multi-disciplinary project encompassing the professions of planning, landscape architecture, architecture, engineering, flood plain specialists, and traffic engineering. This twenty-five million dollar demonstration project provides a national example of an innovative method for capturing a unique identity at the interstate interchange, solving safety and functional hazards, providing for the accommodation of the automobile, pedestrian, and bicycle modes of travel, and creating a parkway experience.

The Front Door project is intended to be an experience shaped by the blending of built and natural forms. The mile-long corridor connects the interstate interchange across an agricultural floodplain to downtown. The importance of this corridor was established by the 1976 Bicentennial willow planting designed by Dan Kiley. Intensive on-site, public working sessions by the design team enabled alternative ideas to be debated and designs to be changed with input from State and City officials, affected property owners and the general public. The design objectives were to improve traffic operations and safety for motorists,

⁶² Francisco Asensio Cerver, *World of Environmental Design: Urban Space III* (Paco Asensio, 1994), pg. 187.

⁶³ Francisco Asensio Cerver, *World of Environmental Design: Urban Space III* (Paco Asensio, 1994), pg. 190.

⁶⁴ Garvin & Berens, *Urban Parks and Open Space*, Urban Land Institute and Trust for Public Land, 1997, pg. 135.

⁶⁵ Jane Brown Gillette, “Michael,” *Landscape Architecture* (February 1998), pg. 68.

pedestrians, and cyclists, and to replace the harsh highway environment with a parkway experience.⁶⁶ A new bridge at the interstate interchange was designed with a clear span of nearly three-hundred feet to accommodate a single-point interchange for traffic and the accommodation of a bicycle path. A conventional bridge of this span was not feasible because of these design parameters, so a cable-stayed bridge with a signature arch form was developed. This unique bridge is now called the Columbus Gateway Arch Bridge, and was opened to traffic in 1997. The landscape design for the entryway system is proposed to be a three-dimensional field of trees planted in a continuous warped grid, which reconciles the linear geometry of the roadways and access ramps of the interstate. The pedestrian system is proposed to include a nature trail along the river's edge, commuter cyclist path, and sidewalk system. Pedestrian links are developed through the interstate interchange by tunneling underneath the interstate access ramps and by traveling in the right-of-way under the clear-span bridge. The project provides improved access to downtown with a new bridge over the White River located as a diagonal approach to the Courthouse. This pylon and cable-stay bridge was opened to traffic in the summer of 1999, and is also of unique design. The red-painted superstructures of both bridges initiate the theme of the bright red Mill Race Park structures.

Individual pieces of the integratively designed project have been constructed to date, with additional funding coming on line to complete the other roadway improvements, pedestrian and landscape systems. The more important constructed pieces include the two bridges designed by Jean Muller, a French engineer. They are excellent examples of the integration of structural function and aesthetic form. The Gateway Arch Bridge on Interstate 65 crosses State Road 46 carrying north and south-bound traffic (two lanes with shoulders on each side) and utilizes a steel "basket-handle" arch with the roadway positioned on the outside of the arches. The roadways are supported by transverse, box-girder floor beams on twenty-foot centers, which in turn are suspended by cable-stay hangers from the arches. The Gateway Bridge has already been the recipient of many design awards, including an Award of Excellence from the Federal Highway Administration. The Second Street Bridge is also a cable stay bridge, with the loads carried by the transverse floor beams transferred to four pylons by the cable stays.

Other design firms involved in the overall Front Door project include: Venturi Scott Brown (architecture), Michael Van Valkenburgh Associates (landscape architecture), Pflum, Klausmeier & Gehrum Consultants (planning and engineering) Storror Kinsella Partnership (bicycle/pedestrian system), Woolpert (engineering), and Christopher B. Burke Associates (flood plain hydrology).

Currently the City of Columbus is continuing to work on its downtown with the assistance of internationally recognized landscape architect William A. Johnson as its urban design consultant. Johnson has encouraged the attraction into the downtown of activities that create an active street life including apartments, restaurants, and arts and performance venues. Pedestrian nodes, connections, linkages, gathering spaces, and downtown signage systems recommended by Johnson constitute a detailed refinement of the earlier established and generalized downtown streetscape plan by Kennon. The first implementation project was the 1988 Columbus Alley Walkway, constructed as an extension of the streetscape vernacular, linking Washington Street to Roche/Dinkeloo's Post Office to the west. A pulsing neon sculpture by San Francisco artist Cork Marcheschi is in purposeful contrast with the historic fabric and scale of the Washington Street facades, drawing pedestrians into and through this narrow passage. Johnson's next project is the development of Sixth Street east of Washington Street as another pedestrian oriented lateral extension of the streetscape. It is Johnson's intent that to link a seasonal farmer's market that he recommends as a shared use of the Carscape site.

Profiles of the Landscape Architects Associated with Columbus

⁶⁶ The Front Door Project, A cooperative solution between the Federal, State, City, and Private Sector, Pflum, Klausmeier & Gehrum Consultants, et al, 1993.

Dan Kiley (1912-)

Kiley worked as an apprentice landscape architect for Warren Manning from 1932 to 1938. He enrolled in the landscape architecture program at Harvard in 1936. While there he met Garrett Eckbo and James Rose, who, with Kiley, would become landscape architecture's pioneer advocates of the Modern movement. What appealed to Kiley about Modern architecture was that it was a New Deal, a new freedom, a new understanding of people that recognized the need to provide proper environments even for poor people. Kiley left Harvard in 1938 before graduating, because he found the dominant Beaux-Arts design approach arid and two-dimensional. Kiley educated himself through his later travels and while on the job. Shortly after leaving Harvard, he worked at the U.S. Housing Authority in Washington, D.C., where he met Louis Kahn. When Kiley was drafted into the Army, he was sent to work for the Office of Strategic Services where Eero Saarinen was serving as the chief of design.

His work with the Army enabled Kiley to travel, where he was profoundly affected by Andre le Notre's work in France. Kiley's signal contribution to design would be to combine the rational grids, geometries, and proportions of classicism with the open-endedness, the dynamism, and the simplicity of Modernism.⁶⁷

In 1945, Kiley returned to New England, and finally settled in Charlotte, Vermont in the early 1950s. Because opportunities in landscape architecture remained nonexistent, Kiley declared himself an architect, and commenced designing houses. Kiley was lured away by other architects, including Eero Saarinen, who asked him to collaborate on the Jefferson National Expansion Memorial, in St. Louis. It launched Kiley's career as a landscape architect.

The Saarinen/Kiley collaborative effort appears to have been a perfect match. Their efforts resulted in a seamless composition of structure and landscape, allowing both to pursue Modernist interpretations of classical forms as unified compositions. The collaborative efforts in Columbus continued with Irwin Union Bank (1954) and North Christian Church (1965).

Kiley continued his collaboration on site development and landscape design in Columbus with a variety of architects. At the same time he was working on a variety of other prominent landscape architecture commissions. A sampling of Kiley's work and the distinguished architects with whom he has collaborated is shown below:

- Jefferson National Expansion Memorial, St. Louis, MO (with Eero Saarinen)
- Eastland Plaza Shopping Centre, Detroit, MI (with Gruen Associates)
- Edmund Pugh Residence, Rye, NY (with I.M. Pei)
- Cummins Engine Company, Columbus, IN (with Harry Weese)
- Miller Residence, Columbus, IN (with Eero Saarinen)
- Detroit Civic Center, Detroit, MI (with Eero Saarinen)
- General Motors, Warren, MI (with Eero Saarinen)
- Chase National Bank, New York, (with Skidmore, Owings & Merrill)
- Tanglewood, Lenox, MA (with Eero Saarinen)
- National Academy of Science, Washington, DC
- Clarence Hamilton House, Columbus, IN
- Lincoln Center for the Performing Arts, New York, NY (with Johnson, Harrison & Abramovitz; and Eero Saarinen)
- Pittsburgh Arts Center, Pittsburgh, PA (with Skidmore, Owings & Merrill)
- Harbor Square Project, Washington, D.C. (with Saarinen and Saarinen)
- IBM Research Lab, Armonk, NY (with Skidmore, Owings & Merrill)
- National Center for Atmospheric Research, Boulder, CO (with I.M. Pei)

⁶⁷ Andrea Oppenheimer Dean, "Modern Master," *Landscape Architecture* (December 1996), pg. 78.

MODERNISM IN BARTHOLOMEW CO. IN, 1942-1999, NATIONAL HISTORIC LANDMARK THEME STUDY Page 43

United States Department of the Interior, National Park Service

National Register of Historic Places Registration Form

- Washington Channel Waterfront, Washington, D.C. (with Saarinen and Saarinen)
- Christian Theological Seminary, Indianapolis, IN (with Edward L. Barnes)
- Hamilton-Cosco Co, Columbus, IN (with Harry Weese)
- Dulles Airport, Chantilly, VA (with Eero Saarinen)
- George Newlin House, Columbus, IN (with Harry Weese)
- National Academy of Sciences, Washington, DC
- Columbus Community Schools, Columbus, IN
- Cummins Darlington Plan, England (with Eero Saarinen)
- Columbus Country Club, Columbus, IN (with Harry Weese)
- Ford Foundation Building, New York, NY (with Roche Dinkeloo and Associates)
- Clarence Hamilton Pool, Columbus, IN
- Irwin Trust Company, Columbus, IN (with Eero Saarinen)
- North Christian Church, Columbus, IN (with Eero Saarinen)
- Richards Elementary School, Columbus, IN (with Edward L. Barnes)
- National Academy of Sciences, Washington, D.C.
- First Baptist Church, Columbus, IN (with Harry Weese)
- Washington Mall, Washington, D.C. (with Skidmore, Owings & Merrill)
- Concordia College, Fort Wayne, IN (with Eero Saarinen)
- Cummins-Fleetguard Plant, Cooksville, TN
- Cummins Warehouse, Columbus, IN
- US Air Force Academy, Colorado Springs, CO (with Skidmore, Owings & Merrill)
- Irwin Union Bank, Columbus, IN
- Oakland Museum, Oakland, CA (with Roche Dinkeloo and Associates)
- Industrial Medical Center of Columbus, Columbus, IN (with Hardy, Holtzman & Pfeiffer)
- Columbus Bank, Columbus, IN
- Columbus Shopping Center, Columbus, IN (with Gruen Associates)
- Columbus Court House Square, Columbus, IN
- Cummins Components Walesboro Plant, Columbus, IN (with Roche Dinkeloo and Associates)
- National Gallery of Art, Washington, D.C.
- Irwin Union Bank, State and Mapleton Branch, Columbus, IN (with Caudill Rowlett Scott)
- Miller Town House, Columbus, IN
- Cummins Engine Company, New Storage, Charleston Plant, Columbus, IN
- Indiana Bell Telephone, Columbus, IN (with Caudill Rowlett and Scott)
- Cummins Engine-Route 46, Columbus, IN
- Washington Cathedral, Washington, D.C.
- National Gallery of Art, Washington, D.C. (with I.M. Pei)
- Cummins Engine Company-Michelin, Brussels, Belgium (with Roth and Moore)
- Cummins Engine Company, Jamestown Plan, Jamestown, NY (with Bruce Adams)
- Cummins Engine Company, Component Plant, Walesboro, IN
- Cummins Engine Company, Main Plant, Columbus, IN (with Bruce Adams)
- Cummins Engine Company, South Mapleton Building, Columbus, IN
- Cummins Engine Company, Madison, IN (with Eisenman & Robertson)
- Cummins Engine Company, Indianapolis, In (with Don Hisaka)
- Dallas Museum of Art, Dallas, TX
- National Sculpture Garden, National Gallery of Art, Washington, D.C.
- The Henry Moore Sculpture Garden, Kansas City, MO
- Schmitt Elementary School and Northside Middle School (with Leers, Weinzapfel)
- John F. Kennedy Library, Boston, MA (with I.M. Pei)

Jack Curtis was graduated from Pennsylvania State University in 1966. After leaving school, he worked for A.E. Bye & Associates, eventually becoming an Associate with the firm. The work and style of Bye greatly influenced Curtis. Bye's landscapes have been described as "so subtly crafted that their sublime beauty is often interpreted as untouched nature."⁶⁸ While Bye's artistry is apparent, he defies easy categorization. Although preoccupied with minimalism and abstraction, Bye rejects the geometry of modernists such as Kiley. Curtis has followed in Bye's design vernacular and often creates naturalized landscapes. For the General Foods project designed by Roche Dinkeloo in Rye Brook, New York, Curtis designed an eighteenth century ideal of nature⁶⁹ that contrasts with the "Corporate Equivalent of the Classical Villa."⁷⁰

Curtis' work is also founded on the practicality and sustainability of the landscape. In many of the landscape renovations he worked on in Columbus, he sought to duplicate the original landscape design using similar but more sustainable materials. Other projects by Jack Curtis include the General Foods Corporate Headquarters site in Rye, New York; Thurgood Marshall Federal Judiciary Building in Washington, D.C.; and the Taft School in Watertown, Connecticut.

Michael Van Valkenburgh

Van Valkenburgh grew up on a farm in rural New York State, and studied Landscape Architecture at Cornell University. He received a Master of Landscape Architecture degree from the University of Illinois at Champaign- Urbana. He worked for a number of firms in Cambridge, most notably Carr, Lynch Associates. In 1982 he founded his own firm and was appointed chair of the landscape architecture department at Harvard University. He is now Charles Eliot, Professor of Landscape Architecture at Harvard. "His design genius seems to lie in three areas: a clear design rhetoric, especially his use of metaphor; his understanding of plants; and his conflicted love relationship with order."⁷¹

Most of Van Valkenburgh's metaphorical forms derive from nature or from abstractions of such landscape types as the park, the campus, the agricultural intervention, and the vernacular yard. He insists that the medium of landscape as an art is earth, water, plants and the overlay of the natural phenomena of the world we live in. He wrote: I was addicted to Dan Kiley. In 1973, I had a Dumbarton Oaks summer fellowship to research Kiley. And the irony is that I got totally transfixed by Farrand's landscape (designer of Dumbarton Oaks) and was trying to understand the roots of Kiley in landscapes like Farrand's.⁷²

Van Valkenburgh has a portfolio of projects that complement his Columbus work. These projects include expansion of the Walker Art Center Sculpture Garden in Minneapolis, Minnesota; Iowa River Garden in Iowa City, Iowa; Allegheny Riverfront Park in Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania; Herman Miller, Inc., in Cherokee County, Georgia, Harvard Yard in Cambridge, Massachusetts; the School of Architecture of the University of Virginia, Charlottesville, Virginia; and Wellesley College in Wellesley, Massachusetts.

William A. Johnson

William A. Johnson is a seasoned practitioner who was a professor of landscape architecture for many years at the University of Michigan while a partner in an award-winning landscape architecture firm with an international practice. Johnson's design approach and evocative illustrative style has influenced a generation of landscape architects and urban designers. A recent project is representative of the scope of Johnson's practice, that being the new town of Harima Science Garden City, Hyogo Prefecture, Japan, in

⁶⁸ Alicia Rodriguez, "A Subtle Hand," *Landscape Architecture* (May 1996), pg. 82.

⁶⁹ Gina M. Crandell, "In Capability," *Landscape Architecture* (May 1984), pg. 50.

⁷⁰ Paul Goldberger, "A Corporate Equivalent of the Classical Villa," (*New York Times*, 3 July 1983), pg. H19-20

⁷¹ Jane Brown Gillette, "Michael," *Landscape Architecture* (February 1998), pg. 70

⁷² Jane Brown Gillette, "Michael," *Landscape Architecture* (February 1998), pg. 72

association with Peter Walker. Drawing on his extensive experience with college campuses and Rocky Mountain resort communities, Johnson emphasized three features in the new town's master plan: walking and biking systems that would knit the community together, an overlay of the open-space and automobile systems, and an integration of architecture and terrain that would celebrate the vertical.⁷³

While technically retired from active practice, Johnson takes on a limited number of commissions that have special interest to him, one being the continuing development and refinement of Columbus's downtown.

Closing Note

Eliel Saarinen said in his address to the Royal Institute of British Architects upon receiving the organization's Gold Medal:

"The first half of the century has been the pioneering search for something to come, whereas the second half is going to be the bringing of the pioneering results into matured form-expression of the whole 20th century. . . . This is a 'joint' action, for sure and so it must be, for – Gold medal or no Gold medal – everyone must try his best in this work, and although it might be true that in this work the individual might occasionally be able to have his voice heard, in the last analysis, it is the Century's voice that counts."⁷⁴

There is a sense in Saarinen's words of expectation that architecture in the second half of the twentieth century would be a special body of work and would represent a change in thinking about the built environment. Bartholomew County contains one of America's premier collections of Modern design. Modernism began its development in the early part of the twentieth century and is now, at the end of the century, being revisited and celebrated for the clarity of its expression. It is appropriate to begin to evaluate and recognize these resources now, while they comprise an intact and vital component of our culture.

⁷³ Jane Brown Gillette, "Mystical Mountains," *Landscape Architecture* (March 1996), pg.71.

⁷⁴ Eliel Saarinen, "Message to the Royal Institute of British Architects." *RIBA Journal* (April 1950).

F. ASSOCIATED PROPERTY TYPES

I. Public Buildings, Structures, and Sites, 1957-1965

II. Description

Public buildings, structures and sites under this property type were supported by private foundations, corporations, or individuals, and built between 1957 and 1965. They include educational buildings and recreational facilities. These resources represent philanthropic support of outstanding Modern architecture, landscapes, design and art, in Columbus and Bartholomew County, Indiana. Most resources are individual properties. In a few cases, there may be small contiguous groups of related resources.

In the case of most resources for this property type, private support was from the same source: an ongoing program of Cummins Engine Foundation that paid the architect's fee for a building if the architect was selected from a list of notable architects compiled by an independent panel. In a few cases, support was from a different source. For example, the Lincoln Center was donated to the community by the Hamilton Foundation. Most resources are in Columbus, the largest incorporated area and the county seat. Most resources are in good condition and have a high degree of integrity. Four of the six educational buildings constructed during the period have additions. These are generally compatible with the original buildings.

III. Significance

This property type is closely related to the Cummins Engine Foundation program that paid the architect's fee for public buildings with the condition that the architect was selected from a list developed by an independent panel. The panel was composed of distinguished architects. The list – newly developed for each commission – typically included names of nationally known up-and-coming architects, and/or established architects. The program was initiated with Schmitt Elementary School (1957). The offer of support initially, in this early period from 1957 to 1965, applied only to schools but was later extended to all public buildings. The first non-school public building supported under the program was Fire Station No. 4, completed in 1967. Cummins Engine Foundation, as well as other local foundations and individuals, also supported public architecture outside the guidelines of the program. Nine public buildings of notable design were built in the Columbus area between 1957 and 1965. Over 20 additional public buildings, structures and sites of notable design were constructed between 1966 and 1999. Seven private commissions complemented the collection of public buildings during the early period. By 1999, there were over 30 private commissions in all. Support of outstanding Modern design in public architecture had several impacts on the Columbus area, including: 1) national recognition as a center of Modern architecture, 2) improved quality of the built environment, 3) establishment of a community identity, and 4) fostering construction of Modern architecture in the private sector.

The resources of this property type are nationally significant under National Register Criterion C and/or National Historic Landmark Criterion 4 in the areas of Architecture, Art, Engineering, and/or Landscape Architecture. The resources represent a nationally recognized program to improve the quality of life in a particular community through outstanding Modern design. The effort in Columbus, the first known program of its type, has inspired similar efforts in other places, including college campuses and communities. Each of the resources of this property type is an outstanding representation of a method of construction, is the work of a nationally recognized master architect or designer, and/or possesses high artistic values. Resources that have achieved significance in the past 50 years are eligible if they are of exceptional importance.

IV. Registration Requirements

Public buildings, structures and sites are eligible if they represent the nationally recognized effort in the Columbus area to encourage outstanding Modern design. Most resources will have been supported by the

Cummins Engine Foundation program. Resources supported by other foundations, corporations, or others may also be eligible if they were clearly part of the ongoing effort to impact the community through exemplary Modern design.

In order to be considered nationally significant under this context a resource must be the work of a nationally recognized designer; and the resource must be recognized as an outstanding example of Modern design through evidence of national or international awards and honors, critical acclaim by the national or international press, and scholarly evaluation. Notable designers also may be defined as those who have received critical acclaim for numerous projects over a period of years in major architectural and design publications.

Resources must have been completed by 1965 or earlier. This termination date reflects the end of the early period of the patronage program as discussed in the context statements. This termination date may be reevaluated in the future with the passage of time and with analysis of further commentary and scholarship.

Buildings designed by still-practicing architects are generally not considered to be eligible because the body of their work is yet to be completed and, therefore, cannot be holistically assessed for historical significance.

Eligible resources should have a high degree of integrity of location, design, setting, materials, and workmanship. Resources should have few alterations. Essential features that should be present for a property to represent its significance include the historic main façade and entry, important public spaces inside the building, and other important interior spaces that define the particular building's historic character and use as a public building. Interior alterations that are not irreversible have much less impact on a property's integrity than permanent changes. An addition will not disqualify a resource; if it is compatible with the original building and not opposed to the intention of the original designer, and if it does not obscure the qualities for which the building is significant.

Sufficient features should be intact to relate the property to the Modern movement in terms of massing, spatial relationships, proportion, pattern of windows and doors, texture of materials, and ornamentation. Some characteristics may be critical in defining a particular resource and should not be altered. For example, in the case of Fire Station No. 4, the relationship of the red and white brick on the main façade is an important element of the building's character and each nomination should define and justify critical building elements. Another example is the importance of spatial relationships in schools like McDowell and Lincoln. For each resource, these critical characteristics will vary.

I. Buildings, Structures, and Sites Representing Modern Architecture and Landscape Architecture, 1942-1999

II. Description

Resources under this property type are representative of Modern architecture and design, and were built between 1942 and 1999 in Bartholomew County. They include churches, commercial buildings, educational facilities, recreational facilities, houses, and industrial buildings. Cumulatively, they represent a unique concentration of resources related to the Modern movement. Modern buildings have certain features in common. Early in the movement, buildings were of simple design; had rectilinear forms, exposed construction materials, little or no ornamentation, generally open interior plans, and spaces that were based on function, rather than carved out of the structure. Also typical of the Modern movement was an integration of all design elements, including interior design, art, and landscape architecture.

Since the buildings of this property type represent a variety of uses, they are scattered throughout the Columbus area. Most resources are in good condition and have a high degree of integrity. Some of the buildings have additions. In most cases, these are compatible with the original building. Parkside Elementary School (1962) has a 1990 addition that is very similar to the original structure in scale, massing, materials, and detailing. Another example of an addition is the one built in 1992 for Northside Middle School (1961). The addition relates well to the original building in scale, detailing, and circulation, but utilizes contrasting materials and colors, as well as variations in form. Neither example of an addition significantly detracts from the historic property's integrity. The former is well-integrated with the original building and does not stand out as an addition. The latter is bolder, and illustrates some of the variations in Modern architecture over the years.

III. Significance

This property type embodies superlative examples of Modern architecture and design by some of the nation's leading practitioners. When Columbus' first important Modern building was completed in 1942 (First Christian Church), this type of architecture had only received limited acceptance in the United States, and was considered radical by many in Columbus. Over time, the community came to appreciate Modern architecture, to embrace it, and to promote it as an important part of its identity.

Columbus' Modern architecture has received a great deal of national acclaim. Some observers have called the community a microcosm of Modern American architecture. In many cases, architects received their Columbus commissions in the early, formative stages of their careers, and have gone on to produce a body of nationally recognized work. In several cases the community's new buildings represented architectural innovation and experimentation. One of the tenets of Modern architecture was the total integration of all elements of design - building, furnishings, art, and landscape architecture - and most properties include contributing elements in some or all of these areas.

The resources of this property type are nationally significant under National Register Criterion C and/or National Historic Landmark Criterion 4 in the areas of Architecture, Art, Engineering, and/or Landscape Architecture. Resources are exemplary designs of the Modern movement in the nation as a whole, and may display innovative designs and construction techniques; as a group, they show changes in these characteristics over time. Many of the properties display an important element of Modern architecture, that of spatial relationships of resources to each other and the environment. Each of the resources of this property type is an outstanding representation of a method of construction, is the work of a nationally recognized master architect or designer, and/or possesses high artistic values. Resources that have achieved significance in the past 50 years are eligible if they are of exceptional importance.

In addition, the resources of this property type are the works of architects and designers who have received high recognition as leaders in their fields. John Morris Dixon put forth some criteria for identifying these notable architects in a 1987 editorial in *Progressive Architecture*: architects who have been awarded the American Institute of Architects Gold Medal (less than one per 10,000 architects), or who are included in *Contemporary Architects*⁷⁵ (less than one out of every 1,000 architects). Dixon wrote: "The roster of our most famous architects, as defined by major honors and inclusion in various reference books, reflects a broad consensus and remains rather stable."⁷⁶ Other high honors include the Pritzker Prize and the Royal Institute of British Architects Gold Medal. Additionally, notable architects might be defined as those who have received critical acclaim for numerous projects over a period of years in major architectural publications.

⁷⁵ Ann Lee Morgan and Colin Naylor. *Contemporary Architects* (2nd edition). Chicago: St. James Press, 1987.

⁷⁶ John Morris Dixon. "Big Name Architects." *Progressive Architecture* (December 1987).

IV. Registration Requirements

Buildings, structures and sites are eligible if they are significant representations of the Modern movement in architecture and design, and display some or all of the features of the style specified in “II. Description” (see above).

In order to be considered nationally significant under this context a resource must be the work of a nationally recognized designer; and the resource must be recognized as an outstanding example of Modern design through evidence of national or international awards and honors, critical acclaim by the national or international press, and scholarly evaluation. Notable designers also may be defined as those who have received critical acclaim for numerous projects over a period of years in major architectural and design publications.

Resources must have been completed by 1965 or earlier. This termination date reflects the end of the early period of the patronage program and shifts in Modern design as discussed in the context statements. This termination date may be reevaluated in the future with the passage of time and with analysis of further commentary and scholarship.

Buildings designed by still-practicing architects are generally not considered to be eligible because the body of their work is yet to be completed and, therefore, cannot be holistically assessed for historical significance.

Eligible resources should have integrity of location, design, setting, materials, and workmanship. Resources should have few alterations. Essential features that should be present for a property to convey its significance include its historic facades, fenestration, principle entries, important public spaces inside the building, and other highly visible and important interior and exterior spaces that define the particular property’s historic character and use. Interior alterations that are not irreversible have much less impact on a property’s integrity than permanent changes. An addition will not disqualify a resource; if it is compatible with the original building and if it is not opposed to the intention of the original designer, and if it does not obscure the qualities for which the building is significant. One of the tenets of Modern architecture was the integration of architecture with landscape architecture, artworks and furnishings. For properties where elements of these related design disciplines were important character-defining features, they should be heavily weighed in evaluating integrity. Examples include the landscape, outdoor sculpture and interior furnishings of the Miller House and the landscape design elements of North Christian Church.

Sufficient features should be intact to relate the property to the Modern movement in terms of massing, spatial relationships, proportion, pattern of windows and doors, texture of materials, and ornamentation. Some characteristics may be critical in defining a particular resource and should not be altered. For example, in the case of Irwin Union Bank and Trust, the ceiling in the main banking area, as an innovative and highly visible feature, is an important element of the building’s character. Another example is the relationship between interior and exterior space seen in the Miller House. For each resource, these critical characteristics will vary, and should be discussed in individual nominations.

G. GEOGRAPHIC DATA

All properties nominated under this study are located in Bartholomew County, Indiana.

H. SUMMARY OF SURVEY AND IDENTIFICATION METHODS

The multiple property submission was largely based on a publication of the Columbus Visitors Center, *A Look at Architecture: Columbus, Indiana*. First published in 1974 and last updated in 1998, this book is tantamount to a survey of Modern architecture and design in Columbus and Bartholomew County. It is generally comprehensive in scope and includes public and private commissions, except for private residences. Information for the book has been compiled as the resources were built and includes for each property:

- property name
- address
- date completed
- name of architect, landscape architect, artist, interior designer, and/or engineer
- date and architect of addition, if any
- description
- history
- photograph of property

Also included in the book is: information about the Cummins Engine Foundation architectural program, with a list of properties it has supported; a list of honors and awards relating to Modern architecture in Bartholomew County; a comprehensive list of resources that includes buildings, bridges, landscapes, and public sculpture; and a list of major works in other places by designers who are represented in Bartholomew County. Because the Modern architecture of Columbus has been well documented, it is possible to identify all resources that may relate to this multiple property submission, with the exception of some private residences.

The Indiana Historic Sites and Structures Inventory, conducted in Bartholomew County in 1979, identified several of the buildings including First Christian Church (1942), Irwin Union Bank and Trust (1954), Lincoln Elementary School (1967), Cleo Rogers Memorial Library (1969), The Republic (1971) and The Commons/Courthouse Center (1973). Although the survey is out of date, particularly in regards to this submission, it is significant, because of their age at the time, that these buildings were included at all. A statement in the survey report under "Methodology" indicates that the buildings were considered exceptional: "Buildings constructed after 1940 were generally excluded from the Inventory unless they were of outstanding importance."⁷⁷

Additional information for historic context statements was researched mainly in the Architectural Archive of Cleo Rogers Memorial Library in Columbus. The archive contains information directly relating the Modern architecture resources in Bartholomew County. The extent of information available varies from resource to resource; but includes some or all of the following for each resource: design drawings and/or construction documents; models; photographs; and publications about resources, designers, Modern architecture in the Columbus area, and the Cummins Engine Company architectural program.

⁷⁷ Indiana Historic Sites and Structures Inventory, *Bartholomew County Interim Report* (Indianapolis: Historic Landmarks Foundation of Indiana, 1980), p. 8.

An informal field survey was conducted as part of the current submission to update data on significant landscapes. Several landscapes were visited including those in downtown Columbus; a private residence; McDowell Elementary School; First Baptist Church; and North Christian Church.

Following initial research, two areas of significance were identified: the nature of the patronage program in Columbus, and the high quality of architecture and design that is representative of the Modern movement. Two historic context statements, based on these areas, have been developed: "Patronage in Public Architecture in Bartholomew County, 1957-1965," and "Modern Architecture and Landscape Architecture in Bartholomew County, 1942-1965." The dates reflect the earliest periods associated with these contexts. Bartholomew County was selected as the geographical area because it is the boundary for Cummins Engine Company's architectural program, and an area sufficient to include all the resources associated with the two context statements.

Two categories of Associated Property Types were established. These are: "Public Buildings, Structures, and Sites, 1957-1965," and "Buildings, Structures, and Sites Representing Modern Architecture and Landscape Architecture, 1942-1965." The first property type was based on associative characteristics and the time period for the "Patronage in Public Architecture" context. The second property type was based on physical attributes and the time period for the "Modern Architecture and Landscape Architecture" context. In the case of both property types, this provided a sufficient group of resources for assessing eligibility.

Integrity requirements are based on knowledge of the current condition of existing properties. Most of the buildings and sites are accessible to the public. The consultants who prepared the submission have a familiarity with the Modern buildings and landscapes of the Columbus area that extends over a period of several years. Nearly all of the buildings and landscapes in this property type retain a high degree of their historic integrity.

Though a great deal of information was available on the Modern resources in Columbus, they had not been evaluated in relation to each other and to each of the two contexts developed for this listing. In order to determine the relative significance of the resources, an evaluation system was developed. A comprehensive list of buildings, including some not included in *A Look at Architecture: Columbus, Indiana*, was compiled. Criteria for evaluating resources was developed.

In order to be potentially eligible as a National Historic Landmark in the areas of architecture or landscape architecture, a resource had to be the work of a nationally recognized architect or landscape architect; and the resource must be recognized as an outstanding example of Modern design through evidence of national or international awards and honors, critical acclaim by the national or international press, and scholarly evaluation. Notable designers also may be defined as those who have received critical acclaim for numerous projects over a period of years in major architectural and design publications. Resources had to have been completed by 1965 or earlier. The justification for this date is discussed in the context statements. Buildings with additions that were completed after 1965 were generally not considered to be eligible. Resources with alterations that compromised their original character were also not considered to be eligible.

Resources designed by still-practicing architects are generally not considered to be eligible because the body of their work is yet to be completed and, therefore, cannot be holistically assessed for historical significance.

For several buildings on the list, there is currently insufficient information to determine whether the resource is of national significance. For the most part, these are houses. An intensive level survey should

be conducted to identify residences, other than the Miller House, that may be potentially eligible under this listing.

To be nationally eligible under the Patronage context, a resource has to meet the above criteria. It also has to have been supported by Cummins Engine Foundation or another Columbus patron, or otherwise important in the development of Columbus' nationally recognized patronage program and architectural identity.

Resources that appear to meet the criteria include, but may not be limited to, the following:

First Christian Church (1942)
Architect: Eliel Saarinen (1873-1950)
(Modern Architecture)

Irwin Union Bank (1954)
Architect: Eero Saarinen (1910-1961)
(Modern Architecture)

Miller House (1957)
Architect: Eero Saarinen (1910-1961)
Landscape Architect: Dan Kiley (1912-)
(Modern Architecture)

Mabel McDowell Elementary School (1960)
Architect: John Carl Warnecke (1919-)
(Modern Architecture and Patronage)

North Christian Church; (1964)
Architect: Eero Saarinen (1910-1961)
Landscape Architect: Dan Kiley (1912-)
(Modern Architecture)

First Baptist Church (1965)
Architect: Harry Weese (1915-1998)
(Modern Architecture)

Nominations under this listing were prepared for the above six properties. All of the six buildings clearly meet the criteria. Additional consideration was given to individual buildings as follows:

First Christian Church was the first of the Modern buildings in Columbus. Designed by master architect Eliel Saarinen, it is widely considered his finest ecclesiastical commission and is considered by many critics to be the most significant work of architecture in Columbus.

The three Eero Saarinen buildings have all been recognized as nationally significant works of architecture, and Eero Saarinen as one of the most important American architects of the century. In including all three, three different building types of the architect's work are represented, each a distinctive work that influenced the course of Modern architecture. The Miller House and the North Christian Church include two nationally significant landscape designs and reflect the long-standing collaborative relationship of Eero and Dan Kiley, one of the foremost practitioners of Modern landscape design.

It is considered essential to include a school, since the Cummins Engine Foundation program started with schools. McDowell is the second school building that was supported by Cummins, but the model for the process in which the architect was selected by the school board from a list supplied by an independent panel. McDowell retains its integrity, and is the only one of the first five schools sponsored by the program that does not have an addition.

First Baptist Church is included as it is generally considered to be Harry Weese's finest Columbus building. Weese was one of the first notable architects to design in Columbus, and had more commissions (18) here than any other architect.

A number of significant buildings do not appear on this initial list of eligible resources. In many cases, it is because the resource does not meet one or more of the established criteria. For example, Robert Venturi's Fire Station No. 4 is an important building, but was not constructed in the period of significance presented, and it is the work of an architect who is still practicing. It will be important to re-evaluate such buildings at the appropriate time. It will also be appropriate to re-evaluate the 1965 termination date for the period as time passes and scholarship expands to assess other potentially exceptional buildings that were constructed later.

Other resources associated with the Patronage program or the Modern architecture context that otherwise meet the above criteria, lacked recognition as works of national significance but, rather, appear to be significant on a local or statewide level. It is possible, however, that buildings in this category may be re-evaluated with the passage of time and additional scholarly evaluation and elevated to a status of national importance. Resources of this type that are potentially eligible for listing in the National Register include, but may not be limited to, the following:

Columbus Village (1951)
Architect; Harry Weese (1915-1998)
(Modern Architecture)

Hamilton Cosco Office Building (1962) 2525 State Street
Architect: Harry Weese (1915-1998), Harry Weese and Associates
Landscape Architect: Dan Kiley (1912-)
(Modern Architecture)

Irwin Union Bank, Hope Branch (1958)
Architect: Harry Weese (1915-1998)
(Modern Architecture)

Irwin Union Bank, State Street Branch (c.1965)
Architect: Harry Weese (1915-1998)
(Modern Architecture)

I. MAJOR BIBLIOGRAPHICAL REFERENCES

- Allen, Stan, FAIA. "A Man of Many Words and Works." *Inland Architect* (May 1999).
- "AIA Poll on Top U.S. Architects and Buildings." *Progressive Architecture* (October 1991).
- "AIA Presents Nine Honor Awards." *Progressive Architecture* (May 1975).
- "America Discovers Columbus." *House and Garden* (July 1976).
- "The Architects." *The Evening Republican* (6 January 1966).
- "Architects Honor 2 Local Buildings." *The Republic* (20 May 1975).
- Arnell, Peter and Bickford, Ted, editors. *Charles Gwathmey and Robert Siegel Buildings and Projects 1964-1984*. New York: Harper and Row, 1984.
- Barnes, Edward Larrabee. *Edward Larrabee Barnes Architect*. New York: Rizzoli, 1994.
- Beardsley, John. "Mill Race Park: Rescuing 'Death Valley.'" *Landscape Architecture* (September 1993).
- Bleam, Gregory. "Modern Classical Themes in the Work of Dan Kiley." *Modern Landscape Architecture, a Critical Review*. Marc Trieb, ed. Cambridge: MIT Press, 1993.
- "Businessmen Rebuild an Indiana Town." *Fortune* (July 1954).
- Byrne, Harlan S. "Cummins Engine Draws Praise for the Benefits It Brings Columbus." *Wall Street Journal* (29 June 1970).
- Campbell, Robert. "Modernism Meets Main Street." *Preservation* (September/October 1998).
- Cerver, Francisco Asensio. *World of Environmental Design, Urban Spaces III (Peripheral Parks)*. Barcelona, 1994.
- Christ-Janer, Albert. *Eliel Saarinen, Finnish-American Architect and Educator*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1948; revised edition, 1979.
- Christ-Janer, Albert. *Modern Church Architecture*. New York: McGraw-Hill, 1962.
- "City Ahead of Its Time." *Toledo Blade* (7 December 1969).
- Clay, Grady. "America Discovers Columbus." *Courier Journal Magazine* (10 October 1965).
- Clay, Grady. "Discovering Columbus." *Landscape Architecture* (June 1996).
- "Collecting Landmarks." *Architectural Review* (July 1967).
- "Columbus: An Architectural Mecca." *The Republic* (11 June 1968).

- Columbus Area Chamber of Commerce. *A Look at Architecture: Columbus, Indiana*. 7th ed. Columbus: Visitors Center, 1998.
- Columbus Area Chamber of Commerce, "Columbus, Indiana, Athens of the Prairie" (tour brochure), 1968.
- Columbus-Bartholomew Plan Commission. "Space for Local Government: A Look at the Alternatives." Columbus, Indiana.
- Columbus-Bartholomew Plan Commission. "Vision for the Future, Phase I: Goals." Columbus, Indiana, November 1984.
- "Columbus, Indiana . . . A Study in Small Town Progress." *Architectural Forum* (October 1955).
- Columbus Plan Commission. "Comprehensive Plan 1985." Columbus, Indiana, 1967.
- "A Contemporary Palladian Villa." *Architectural Forum* (September 1958).
- Crandall, Gina M. "In Capability." *Landscape Architecture* (May/June 1984).
- Cross, Robert. "Rest Assured Harry Weese is Keeping Chicago." *Chicago Tribune* (20 May 1979).
- Dal Co, Francisco. *Kevin Roche*. New York: Rizzoli, 1985.
- Dean, Andrea Oppenheimer. "Modern Master." *Landscape Architecture* (February 1996).
- "Designing Company." *Wall Street Journal* (6 March 1967).
- Dixon, John Morris. "Big Name Architects." *Progressive Architecture* (December 1987).
- Dixon, John Morris. "Columbus, Indiana: The Town That Architecture Made Famous." *Architectural Forum* (December 1965).
- "Downtown Dreams." *The Republic*. (18 November 1988).
- Drexler, Arthur. *Transformations in Modern Architecture*. New York: Museum of Modern Art, 1979.
- Emanuel, Muriel. *Contemporary Architects* (3rd edition). New York: St. James Press, 1994.
- "Excellence in Indiana." *Architectural Forum* (August, 1962).
- Forgey, Benjamin. "Columbus, a 'Rare Community' to Post Writer." *Washington Post* (10 October 1986).
- Freeman, Allen. "Living in an Architectural Museum." *AIA Journal* (March 1980).
- Futagawa, Yukio. *Kevin Roche and John Dinkeloo and Associates 1962-1975*. New York: Architectural Book Publishing Company, 1977.
- Gapp, Paul. "Discovering Columbus." *Chicago Tribune Magazine* (22 August 1976).

- Garvin, Alexander, and Berens, Gayle, Principal Authors. *Urban Parks and Open Space*. Urban Land Institute and The Trust for Public Land, 1997.
- Gillette, Jane Brown. "Kiley Revisited." *Landscape Architecture* (August 1998).
- Gillette, Jane Brown. "Michael." *Landscape Architecture* (February 1998).
- Gillette, Jane Brown. "Mystical Mountains." *Landscape Architecture* (March 1996).
- Gilmore, James. "Michigan City 'Inspired' by Local Architectural Program." *The Republic* (14 August 1974).
- Giovannini, Joseph. "Public Visions of Stanley Saitowitz." *Architecture* (August, 1995).
- Glick, Jean Flora. "Camelot in the Cornfields." *Metropolis* (October 1988).
- Goldberger, Paul. "Brash, Young, and Post-Modern." *New York Times Magazine* (20 February 1977).
- Goldberger, Paul. "Collecting on a Grand Scale." *New York Times Magazine* (26 April 1981).
- Gordon, Whitney H. "Middletown U.S.A. and Good Architecture." *Transactions, Social Sciences and Modern Society* (May 1969): vol. 6, no. 7.
- Griswold, Mac. "The Year of Living Responsibly." *Landscape Architecture* (November 1993).
- Gunts, Edward. "Disney Unveils New Town." *Architecture* (August 1991).
- Halik, Nancy Lickerman. Interviews with Bruce Adams, Charles Bassett, Gunnar Birkerts, John Dinkeloo, Paul Kennon, J. Irwin Miller, Cesar Pelli, Kevin Roche, Robert Venturi, and Harry Weese. Conducted 1978-79. Transcriptions in Architectural Archive of Cleo Rogers Memorial Library, Columbus, Indiana.
- Halik, Nancy Lickerman. "The Eero Saarinen Spawn." *Inland Architect* (May 1981).
- Harvey, Dody, "Updated Landscape Survey" (Compiled for Columbus Visitors Center Volunteers, 1996).
- "Harry Weese: A Young Architect Recalls the Old Chicago School." *Architectural Forum* (May 1962).
- Hilderbrand, Gary R. *The Miller Garden, Icon of Modernism*. Washington D.C.: Spacemaker Press, 1999.
- Hitchcock, Henry-Russell and Johnson, Philip. *The International Style*. New York: Museum of Modern Art, 1932.
- "How Columbus Discovered Architecture." *St. Louis Globe Democrat* (19 October 1969).
- Hunt, William Dudley Jr. *Encyclopedia of American Architecture*. New York: McGraw-Hill Book Company, 1980.
- Indiana Historic Sites and Structure Inventory. *Bartholomew County Interim Report*. Indianapolis: Historic Landmarks Foundation of Indiana, 1980.

- Jeffery, David. "A Most Uncommon Town, Columbus." *National Geographic* September 1978.
- Johnson, Jory, and Frankel, Felice. *Modern Landscape Architecture*. New York: Abbeville Press, 1991.
- Kahn, Eve M. "Uncovering the Waterfront." *Wall Street Journal*. December 30, 1992.
- Kalins, Dorothy. "This is Irwin Miller." *Town and Country* (July 1974).
- Kamin, Blair. "Exploring Columbus." *Chicago Tribune* (30 November 1993).
- Kay, Jane Holtz. "Columbus, Indiana, Stalking and Appraising an Architectural Mecca." *Christian Science Monitor* (15 October 1982).
- Kay, Jane Holtz. "Modernism: The Invisible Guest." *Landscape Architecture* (January 1990).
- Kennedy, Roger G. *American Churches*. New York: Stewart, Tabor & Chang, 1982.
- "Kevin Roche John Dinkeloo 1964-1974." *Architectural Forum* (March 1974).
- Kiley Dan, and Amidon, Jane. *Dan Kiley: The Complete Works of America's Master Landscape Architect*. Boston: Bulfinch Press, 1999.
- Korab, Balthazar. *Columbus Indiana*. Documen Press, 1989.
- Kuh, Katharine. "Discovering Columbus." *Saturday Review* (21 August 1971).
- "Landscape Design: Works of Dan Kiley." *Process Architecture: 33*. Tokyo, 1982.
- Loengard, John. "An Inspired Renaissance in Indiana." *Life* (17 November 1967).
- Long, Laura Mooney. "Irwin Union Bank and Trust Company" (1954).
- "Machine, Man & Architecture." *Architectural Record* (October 1975).
- Markham, Wayne. "Innovations Began with Church." *Miami Herald* (26 August 1979).
- Marvel, Bill. "A Quiet Town Becomes an Architectural Museum." *The National Observer* (6 September 1971).
- McCaslin, Walt. "Athens of the Prairie." *Saturday Evening Post* (21 March 1964).
- McQuade, Walter. "Eero Saarinen, A Complete Architect." *Architectural Forum* (April 1962).
- Metropolitan Review* (Special Issue on Eliel Saarinen). Chicago: Metropolitan Press Publications, November/December 1989.
- Michener, James A. *James A. Michener's U.S.A.* New York: Crown Publishing Company, 1981.
- "Mill Race Park." *Architectural Record* (November 1993).

Miller, Catherine G. *Carscape, A Parking Handbook*. Columbus, Indiana: Washington Street Press, 1988.

Miller, J. Irwin. Interview with Louis Joyner and Laura Thayer, 8 June 1999.

Miller, William I. Interview with Louis Joyner and Laura Thayer, 8 June 1999.

Miller, Xenia. "The Landscape of the North Christian Church." Written for Visitors Center Tour Guides, 21 May 1996.

Miller, Nory. "Exploring the Fundamentals in Fundamentalist Columbus, Indiana." *Inland Architect* (December 1972).

"NBM Honors J. Irwin Miller" and "Shaping a Community." *Blueprints* (Fall 1986).

"A New Concept of Beauty." *House and Garden* (February 1959).

"Nine Buildings Win AIA Honor Awards." *Architectural Record* (June 1975).

Norment, Kate, et al. *Hardy, Holzman, Pfeiffer Associates, Buildings and Projects 1967-1992*. New York: Rizzoli, 1992.

"Open Planning in Columbus." *Progressive Architecture* (February 1972).

Pearson, Clifford. "Building a Legacy of Design Excellence." *Architectural Record* (January 1990).

Pflum, Klausmeier & Gehrum Consultants, et al. *Columbus Gateway Corridor Study, Charrette No. 1* (October 1991).

Pflum, Klausmeier & Gehrum Consultants, et al. *Front Door Project, A Cooperative Solution, Federal, State, City, Private Sector* (May 1993).

Placzek, Adolf K. *MacMillan Encyclopedia of Architects* (volume 3). London: The Free Press, 1982.

Posner, Ellen. "Hoosier Mecca for Modern Architecture." *Wall Street Journal* (16 January 1984).

Prugh, Peter. "Designing Company." *Wall Street Journal* (March 6, 1967).

"Public Visions of Stanley Saitowitz." *Architecture* (August 1995).

"The Republic Architect, Goldsmith, Dies at Home." *The Republic* (17 July 1996).

Rudzinski, Russell, "Finnish-American Modernism: the First Christian Church by Eliel and Eero Saarinen 1942." Unpublished manuscript, December 1997.

Rutherford, John. "Columbus Held 'Model City.'" *The Republic* (14 June 1971).

Saarinen, Aline, ed. *Eero Saarinen On His Work*. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1962.

"Schools That Say 'Now.'" *Christian Science Monitor* (27 February 1968).

Schmertz, Mildred. "An Industrial Medical Center Design for Human Beings." *Architectural Record* (April 1972).

Schmertz, Mildred F. "An Open Plan Elementary School." *Architectural Record* (September 1973).

Schmertz, Mildred and Polites, Nicholas. *Hardy Holzman Pfeiffer Associates Buildings and Projects 1967-1992*. New York: Rizzoli, 1992.

Scully, Vincent, Jr. *Modern Architecture*. New York: George Braziller, 1961.

Sharp, Dennis. *The Illustrated Encyclopedia of Architects and Architecture*. New York: Quatro Publications, 1991.

"Showplace on the Prairie." *Time Magazine* (5 December 1977).

Simons, Richard S. "Columbus." *Indianapolis Star Magazine* (14 January 1951).

Skidmore, Owings & Merrill. *Indiana Central Area Plan*. Columbus, Indiana, 1969.

Skidmore, Owings & Merrill. *Central Area Master Plan*. Columbus, Indiana, 1983.

"Some Community Ideas...Columbus, Indiana." Unpublished Report, 1998.

"The Small-Scale Cluster Approach" *School Board Journal* (May 1961).

Stern, Robert A.M. *Robert A.M. Stern Buildings*. New York: Monacelli Press, 1996.

Stimpson, Miriam. *A Field Guide to Landmarks of Modern Architecture*. Englewood Cliffs, NY: Prentice Hall, 1985.

Storrow, Meg and Kinsella, John. "The Leveraging of Infrastructure Renewal to Create an Interstate Front Door." *1997 Annual Meeting Proceedings*. Edited by Cheryl Wagner. Washington, D.C.: American Society of Landscape Architects, 1997.

Sweeney, Elsie Irwin, "Symbolism of the First Christian Church." Unpublished manuscript in the Architectural Archive of Bartholomew County Library, Columbus, Indiana.

Taylor, Robert, et al. *Indiana: A New Historical Guide* (2nd edition). Indianapolis: Indiana Historical Society, 1992.

"This is Columbus." *Indiana Business and Industry* (February 1965).

Thomas, Bill. "The Athens of the Prairie is a Rare Architectural Oasis." *New York Times* (22 March 1970).

Tomkins, Calvin. "The Garden Artist." *The New Yorker*. (16 October 1995).

"To Dedicate North Christian Church Sunday." *The Evening Republican* (18 April 1964).

"Two More for Columbus." *Architectural Forum* (March 1970).

“Van Valkenburgh and Saitowitz Collaborate in Columbus.” *Architectural Record* (September 1991).

Venturi, Scott-Brown and Associates. *Venturi, Scott-Brown and Associates*. Seoul: Seoul Art Museum/Plus Publishing, 1992.

Vecsey, George. “Columbus, Indiana Grows Used to Its Fine Architecture.” *New York Times* (17 May 1971).

Von Eckardt, Wolf. “‘Collector’ Makes His City a Showcase.” *Washington Post* (1 May 1966).

Von Moos, Stanislaus. *Venturi, Rauch and Scott-Brown*. New York: Rizzoli, 1987.

Warnecke, John Carl. Letter to Louis Joyner, 15 July 1999.

Weese, Kitty Baldwin. *Harry Weese Houses*. Chicago: Chicago Review Press, 1987.